Generated using the official AMS  $\[\]$  TEX template v6.1

1	Atmospheric Response to a Collapse of the North Atlantic Circulation Under
2	A Mid-Range Future Climate Scenario: A Regime Shift in Northern
3	Hemisphere Dynamics
4	Clara Orbe <sup>a,b</sup> , David Rind <sup>a</sup> , Ron Miller <sup>a</sup> , Larissa Nazarenko <sup>a,c</sup> , Anastasia Romanou <sup>a,b</sup> , Jeff
5	Jonas <sup>a,c</sup> , Gary Russell <sup>a</sup> , Maxwell Kelley <sup>a</sup> , and Gavin Schmidt <sup>a</sup>
6	<sup>a</sup> NASA Goddard Institute for Space Studies, New York, NY
7	<sup>b</sup> Department of Applied Physics and Applied Mathematics, Columbia University, New York, NY
8	<sup>c</sup> Center for Climate Systems Research, Earth Institute, Columbia University, New York, NY

<sup>9</sup> Corresponding author: Clara Orbe, clara.orbe@nasa.gov

ABSTRACT: Climate models project a future weakening of the Atlantic Meridional Overturning 10 Circulation (AMOC), but the impacts of this weakening on climate remain highly uncertain. A 11 key challenge in quantifying the impact of an AMOC decline is in isolating its impact, relative 12 to other changes related to increased greenhouse gases. Here we isolate the climate impacts of a 13 weakened AMOC in the broader context of a warming climate using a unique ensemble of SSP 14 2-4.5 integrations that was performed using the CMIP6 version of the NASA Goddard Institute 15 for Space Studies ModelE (E2.1). In these runs internal variability alone results in a spontaneous 16 bifurcation of the ocean flow, wherein two out of ten ensemble members exhibit an entire AMOC 17 collapse, while the other eight recover at various stages despite identical forcing of each ensemble 18 member and with no externally prescribed freshwater perturbation. We show that an AMOC 19 collapse results in an abrupt northward shift and strengthening of the Northern Hemisphere (NH) 20 Hadley Cell and intensification of the northern midlatitude jet. We then use a set of coupled 21 atmosphere-ocean abrupt  $CO_2$  experiments spanning the range  $1-5xCO_2$  to show that this response 22 to an AMOC collapse results in a nonlinear shift in the NH circulation moving from 2- to 3xCO<sub>2</sub>. 23 Slab-ocean versions of these experiments, by comparison, do not capture this nonlinear behavior. 24 Our results suggest that changes in ocean heat flux convergences associated with an AMOC collapse 25 — while highly uncertain — can result in profound changes in the NH circulation and continued 26 efforts to constrain the AMOC response to future climate change are needed. 27

#### 28 1. Introduction

Future projections of the atmospheric circulation remain highly uncertain and reflect uncertainties 29 in the direct radiative response to  $CO_2$  forcing (Deser and Phillips (2009); Grise and Polvani (2014); 30 Shaw and Voigt (2015); Ceppi et al. (2018)), as well as both the (direct) response to changes in 31 sea surface temperatures (SSTs) and the (indirect) response to changes in eddy feedbacks (see 32 Shepherd (2014) and references therein). Among the former, uncertainties in SST projections over 33 the subpolar North Atlantic are particularly consequential, as they strongly influence the location 34 and strength of the North Atlantic storm track, with profound downstream impacts on precipitation 35 and wintertime weather over Europe and parts of Africa (e.g., Zhang and Delworth (2006), Smith 36 et al. (2010), Woollings et al. (2012), O'Reilly et al. (2016)). In particular, while increases in 37 greenhouse gases over the 21<sup>st</sup> century are expected to result in substantial warming over much of 38 the North Atlantic, climate models project considerable cooling over midlatitudes resulting in a 39 so-called "North Atlantic warming hole (NAWH)" (e.g., Josey et al. (2018), Drijfhout et al. (2012), 40 Robson et al. (2016), Caesar et al. (2018)). While the drivers of this NAWH have been under 41 considerable debate, recent detection-attribution analysis suggests that the anthropogenic signal 42 of the NAWH has emerged from internal climate variability and, moreover, that this cooling can 43 be attributed to declining northward oceanic heat flux over recent decades related to increased 44 greenhouse gas emissions (Chemke et al. (2022)). 45

Among other mechanisms contributing to the development of the NAWH, the slowdown of 46 the Atlantic Meridional Overturning Circulation (AMOC) has been invoked as one potential key 47 driver (Cheng et al. (2013), Rahmstorf et al. (2015), Menary and Wood (2018)). Studies have 48 long shown that changes in the strength of the AMOC can have widespread impacts not only 49 on other components of the ocean circulation but, more generally, on the broader atmospheric 50 climate system, resulting in a southward shift of the intertropical convergence zone (ITCZ) (e.g., 51 Zhang and Delworth (2005), Vellinga and Wood (2008), Jackson et al. (2015)), a strengthening 52 of the Walker circulation (e.g., Vial et al. (2018), Orihuela-Pinto et al. (2022)) and a northward 53 shift of the Northern Hemisphere (NH) jet stream (e.g., Liu et al. (2020), Bellomo et al. (2021)). 54 Understanding the global scale atmospheric response to changes in AMOC strength is important 55 not only for projections of future climate, but also for understanding paleoclimate records and 56 the dynamics of past Dansgaard-Oeschger events. In particular, while the future collapse of an 57

AMOC is still considered unlikely, the latest generation of coupled climate models project stronger weakening with future warming, compared to older generations of models (Weijer et al. (2020)).

In addition to its impacts on global precipitation, SST-related changes in the AMOC can change 60 the baroclinicity of the atmosphere, which can result in changes in the storm tracks (Woollings 61 et al. (2012)). However, the precise impacts of a weakened AMOC on atmospheric baroclinity 62 are not well understood, largely because studies have used models that exhibit a wide diversity 63 in the amplitude and spatial extent of the NAWH (Gervais et al. (2019), Haarsma et al. (2015), 64 Menary and Wood (2018)). Nonetheless, despite these uncertainties in the drivers and extent of 65 the NAWH, Woollings et al. (2012) showed that the response of the North Atlantic storm track to 66 climate change was singularly shaped by changes in ocean-atmosphere coupling. 67

The role of the AMOC in future projections of the jet stream in the Climate Model Intercom-68 parison Project phase 5 (CMIP5) and phase 6 (CMIP6) models was recently examined in Bellomo 69 et al. (2021) (hereafter KB2021), who showed that changes in the AMOC play a primary role 70 in determining the magnitude of the projected poleward displacement of the NH zonal mean jet 71 stream. In particular, by stratifying models according to the strength of their projected AMOC 72 weakening (in response to a quadrupling of CO<sub>2</sub>), the authors showed that models with a larger 73 AMOC decline (> 7 Sy, relative to preindustrial values) exhibit minimum warming over the North 74 Atlantic, a southward displacement of the intertropical convergence zone (ITCZ) and a poleward 75 shift of the northern midlatitude jet. The results from KB2021 suggest that the AMOC is a major 76 driver of intermodal uncertainty in future projections of the northern jet stream (and associated 77 hydrological impacts). 78

A key challenge in quantifying the impact of AMOC uncertainties on future projections of the 79 large-scale atmospheric circulation is in isolating its impact, relative to other changes related to 80 increased greenhouse gases. Thus, while the results from KB2021 are compelling, that study drew 81 conclusions based on the spread among models subject to the same abrupt  $4xCO_2$  forcing and 82 it is not clear if the models exhibiting greater AMOC weakening were also models that exhibit 83 other characteristics that would independently impact the jet stream. At the same time, previous 84 studies using more traditional freshwater flux perturbations to examine the jet (and other climate) 85 responses to a weakened AMOC, have done so in the absence of other background changes related 86 to increased  $CO_2$  (e.g., Zhang and Delworth (2005), Jackson et al. (2015)). As such, these studies 87

may produce a circulation response to a weakened AMOC that is different than what might occur
if other factors impacting atmospheric temperature gradients are included.

One recent attempt to isolate the climate impacts of a weakened AMOC in the broader context 90 of a warming climate was performed in Liu et al. (2020). In that study, the authors compared fully 91 coupled RCP8.5 simulations using a full physics comprehensive model (CCSM4) with identically 92 forced simulations in which a negative freshwater perturbation over the subpolar North Atlantic 93 was added after year 1980 in order to maintain the AMOC strength (while preserving all other 94 forcings). That study showed results that were generally consistent with KB2021, pointing to a 95 major role of the AMOC in causing widespread cooling stretching from NH high latitudes to the 96 tropics and a poleward displacement of the NH midlatitude jet. 97

While the results from Liu et al. (2020) represent an important step forward in isolating the 98 impacts of the AMOC on the storm tracks in the context of a warming climate, it is not clear 99 that prescribing a negative freshwater perturbation does not potentially interfere with nonlinear 100 components of the AMOC response in a coupled system. To this end, here we present new results 101 featuring an ensemble of SSP 2-4.5 integrations that was performed using the CMIP6 version 102 of the NASA Goddard Institute for Space Studies (GISS) ModelE (E2.1) (Kelley et al. (2020)). 103 In particular, we show results from a subset of the runs documented in Romanou et al. (Under 104 Review) (hereafter AR2022), in which the authors identified a tipping point in the SSP 2-4.5 105 ensemble occurring during the "extended" portion of the simulations (i.e. beyond year 2090, after 106 which  $CO_2$  emissions are ramped down). During this time period the authors show that internal 107 variability alone results in a spontaneous bifurcation of the ocean flow, wherein two out of ten 108 ensemble members exhibit an entire AMOC collapse, while the other eight recover at various 109 stages (Figure 1a). Note that, in contrast to the aforementioned freshwater hosing studies, in which 110 an AMOC collapse is induced by adding freshwater, in these experiments the AMOC collapse is 111 caused by a reduction in evaporation from the ocean, mediated by sea ice melting (AR2022). As 112 such, the atmospheric configuration that is used to produce this effect in an interactive mode is likely 113 to be very different from an atmosphere which is simply responding to a prescribed freshwater flux 114 perturbation. 115

Whereas AR2022 focused primarily on the oceanic conditions giving rise to this divergence in AMOC behavior among different ensemble members, here we focus on the subsequent impacts

this has on the atmospheric large-scale circulation. In particular, we contrast the behavior between 118 two and eight ensemble members in which the AMOC respectively collapses and recovers to 119 historical values by year 2400 (red vs. green lines, Fig. 1a). As such, we isolate the impact of 120 a weakened AMOC on the atmospheric circulation in the presence of increased greenhouse gas 121 warming using a single model (unlike KB2021) and without any need to invoke negative freshwater 122 perturbations (as in Liu et al. (2020)). To the best of our knowledge, this represents the first time 123 that the AMOC imprint on the circulation has been isolated in the context of background increases 124 in greenhouse gases using a fully coupled comprehensive model, absent any externally imposed 125 freshwater perturbations that may potentially interfere with the model's internal dynamics. 126

As discussed in AR2022, the ensemble members in which the AMOC collapses are substantially 127 cooler than those runs in which it recovers, with wintertime global mean surface temperature 128 (GMST) differences of about 1°C by year 2400 (Fig. 1c). Therefore, in documenting the influence 129 of the AMOC on the atmosphere in the different SSP 2-4.5 ensemble members it is natural to 130 ask how the large-scale thermodynamic and dynamical circulations scale with these differences 131 in GMST. Though perhaps naive, it is common practice to assume that the climate system scales 132 linearly with GMST, as reflected in the use of so-called "global warming levels" in the recent 133 IPCC AR6 report (James et al. (2017)) and the widely applied related practice of "pattern scaling" 134 (e.g., Santer et al. (1990), Tebaldi and Arblaster (2014)). Recent studies, however, have shown that 135 the climate's so-called "dynamical sensitivity" - in particular, circulation shifts associated with 136 changes in the Hadley Cell and storm tracks - do not scale with equilibrium climate sensitivity 137 (Grise and Polvani (2016), Ceppi et al. (2018)). As those studies, however, focused on large 138 (CMIP5) multi-model ensembles, it is not clear if similar conclusions also apply to single models 139 and to climate states in which the AMOC has undergone a substantial weakening. More precisely, 140 it remains unclear how much of the circulation response to a weakened AMOC is related simply 141 to changes in GMST or, rather, to changes in (free-tropospheric) meridional temperature gradients 142 away from the surface. 143

To this end, in addition to reporting on the results from the SSP 2-4.5 ensemble we also examine a suite of abrupt  $1-5xCO_2$  experiments that were conducted using the same model version (Mitevski et al. (2021)). In particular, we exploit the fact that between 2- and  $3xCO_2$  abrupt forcing the AMOC respectively recovers and collapses by year 150 (Fig. 1b), behavior which is generally



FIG. 1. Top: Evolution of the annual mean maximum overturning stream function in the Atlantic ocean, evaluated at 48°N, compared among the SSP 2-4.5 (8) recovered and (2) collapsed ensemble members (top, left) and among the abrupt XxCO<sub>2</sub> runs (top, right). Bottom: Same as top panels, except showing annual mean global surface temperature (GMST). Vertical solid lines mark the beginning of the "extension" portion of the SSP 2-4.5 scenario. Vertical dashed lines indicate the years after which climatological averages are evaluated (i.e., years 2400-2500 (left) and years 120-150 (right))

similar to the differences in AMOC behavior between the recovered and collapsed members of 148 the SSP 2-4.5 ensemble, hereafter referred to as SSP 2-4.5 R and SSP 2-4.5 C, respectively (Fig. 149 1a). However, by spanning a much broader range of GMST responses, compared to the SSP 2-4.5 150 ensemble – and assuming that the atmospheric responses to an AMOC collapse are similar between 151 the 3xCO<sub>2</sub> and SSP 2-4.5 collapsed ensemble members (a point which we examine in Section 3a3) 152 - the broader set of XxCO<sub>2</sub> experiments affords a unique opportunity to investigate the relationship 153 between dynamical and equilibrium climate sensitivity in the presence of a collapsed AMOC. 154 In Section 3 we begin by contrasting the large-scale atmospheric circulation responses between 161

the SSP 2-4.5 R and C members in which the AMOC recovers and remains collapsed after year 2400 (Sections 3a1-2, Q1 below). We then compare this behavior with the circulation differences

with the  $2xCO_2$  and  $3xCO_2$  integrations (Section 3a3, Q2). After showing that the  $3xCO_2$ 164 circulation changes in the NH are largely dominated by the behavior of the AMOC, we then 165 further use the broader set of  $1-5xCO_2$  abrupt experiments to examine how the collapse of the 166 AMOC modulates the relationship between the NH dynamical circulation and GMST over a much 167 broader range of  $CO_2$  forcing (Section 3b, Q3). In addressing the latter we also use slab-ocean 168 model integrations in order to examine if the behavior exhibited in the coupled atmosphere-ocean 169 runs is reflected in simulations in which ocean heat flux convergence changes associated with an 170 AMOC collapse are not allowed to occur. 171

172

<sup>173</sup> The main goals of the manuscript are centered around addressing these three questions:

174

 $_{175}$  Q1) How does a collapse of the AMOC influence the atmospheric circulation in the presence of the same background CO<sub>2</sub> forcing (SSP 2-4.5 ensemble)?

177

Q2) How does this compare with the response to an AMOC collapse induced by different
CO<sub>2</sub> forcing (2xCO<sub>2</sub> vs. 3xCO<sub>2</sub>)?

180

Q3) Are AMOC-related circulation changes mediated primarily by GMST or by changes
 in atmospheric temperature gradients?

183

In addressing Q1-Q3 we show that the AMOC tipping point described in AR2022 results in a vastly different atmospheric response between ensemble members in which the AMOC collapses versus members in which the AMOC recovers. In particular, in our model the atmospheric response to an AMOC collapse (occurring on the timescales addressed in this study) reflects a regime shift between a climate state in which the NH Hadley Cell and midlatitude jet are substantially weaker and displaced further equatorward (strong AMOC) compared to a state in which they are substantially stronger and displaced poleward (weak AMOC).

#### **191 2. Analysis/Methods**

#### <sup>192</sup> a. Models and Experiments

Here we use simulations from two sets of experiments produced using the GISS version E2.1 climate model (GISS-E2-1-G) (Kelley et al. (2020)), which consists of a 40-level atmospheric model with a horizontal resolution of 2° x 2.5° latitude/longitude coupled to the 1° horizontal resolution 40-level GISS Ocean v1 (GO1) model (for more details of GO1 see AR2022). Comprehensive reviews of this model's response to historical and future climate change simulations are provided in Miller et al. (2021) and Nazarenko et al. (2022), respectively.

We first examine results from the SSP 2-4.5 ensemble that contributed to the official submission of 199 the NASA-GISS climate group to CMIP6. In particular, we contrast the behaviors of eight members 200 in which the AMOC has recovered by year 2400 (SSP 2-4.5 R) with two members in which it has 201 remained collapsed (SSP 2-4.5 C) (Fig. 1a). As discussed in AR2023, this contrasting behavior 202 emerges during the "extension" portion following year 2090, beyond which CO<sub>2</sub> concentrations 203 slow down in growth from 597 ppm to 643 ppm at year 2200 and decline thereafter (Meinshausen 204 et al. (2020)). That study further showed that the divergence in the behavior of the AMOC results 205 from stochastic variability associated with sea-ice transport and melting in the Irminger Sea that 206 led to a reduction in evaporation and salinity. Note that, whereas AR2023 was primarily focused on 207 identifying the mechanisms leading to different recovery times among the SSP 2-4.5 R, our interest 208 is in quantifying the impact of an AMOC collapse on the large-scale circulation after year 2400. 209 To this end, we treat the SSP 2-4.5 R and C simulations as comprising two distinct "recovered" 210 and "collapsed" ensembles. 211

To put the SSP 2-4.5 results in a broader context, we also examine the coupled atmosphere-ocean 212 1-5xCO<sub>2</sub> abrupt CO<sub>2</sub> experiments reported in Mitevski et al. (2021), which were performed using 213 the same version of the model. We restrict our attention to a subset of the runs, focusing mainly 214 on the 2- and 3xCO<sub>2</sub> runs, but also including results from the 4- and 5xCO<sub>2</sub> simulations when 215 commenting on the linearity of the atmospheric circulation responses with respect to changes in 216 GMST (Section 3b). As shown in Figure 1, the behavior of the AMOC by the end of the abrupt 2-217 and 3xCO<sub>2</sub> runs is generally very similar to the AMOC behavior in the SSP 2-4.5 R and C ensemble 218 members, respectively, past year 2400. This similar behavior also appears at lower latitudes (26°N) 219

(not shown), consistent with the findings in AR2022, who showed a strong correlation in AMOC
 strength at these two latitudes (0.97) within the broader SSP 2-4.5 ensemble.

In addition to the results from the fully coupled ocean-atmosphere model (hereafter FOM) SSP 222 2-4.5 and XxCO<sub>2</sub> integrations, we also show results from q-flux or slab-ocean model (SOM) 223 integrations spanning the range  $1-5xCO_2$ . In these experiments any changes in ocean horizontal 224 heat transport and vertical heat uptake by the deep ocean are not included as the ocean heat flux 225 convergences in the mixed layer ( $-\nabla \cdot (vT)$ , including both horizontal and vertical heat fluxes) are 226 calculated using preindustrial control values. At the same time, the SOM experiments do capture 227 the mixed layer temperature changes resulting from changes in the net surface heat fluxes (hereafter 228 referred to as "thermodynamic" ocean coupling). As such, contrasting the responses in the FOM 229 and SOM experiments isolates the role of dynamic (i.e. ocean heat flux convergence) coupling on 230 the atmospheric responses in the FOM simulations, consistent with the presentation in Chemke et al. 231 (2022). Note that this approach does not explicitly isolate the contribution of changes in SSTs to the 232 atmospheric circulation response, as the SST response reflects both changes in thermodynamic and 233 dynamic ocean-atmosphere coupling. However, robustly isolating the impact of SSTs can be tricky 234 as previous studies utilizing prescribed SST "warming hole" patterns have shown large sensitivity 235 to how these patterns are prescribed, particularly in relation to SST gradients (see discussion in 236 Gervais et al. (2019)). 237

#### <sup>238</sup> b. Temporal Averaging and Spatial Domains

To compare the atmospheric responses from the SSP 2-4.5 simulations with those from the abrupt 239 CO<sub>2</sub> experiments we focus on climatological averaging periods during which the characteristics 240 of the AMOC are similar, i.e., years when the AMOC has recovered in the 2xCO<sub>2</sub> and SSP 2-4.5 241 R runs, while the AMOC has remained collapsed in the 3xCO<sub>2</sub> and SSP 2-4.5 C experiments. 242 As indicated in Figure 1 (dashed black vertical lines) this corresponds to years beyond which the 243 maximum value of the overturning stream function at 48°N has reached nearly zero, corresponding 244 to years 120-150 and 2400-2500 in the XxCO<sub>2</sub> and SSP 2-4.5 integrations, respectively. We refer 245 to these periods hereafter as the "equilibrated" responses in the model, bearing in mind that the 246 AMOC exhibits multi-centennial instability as was illustrated in an older version of the GISS 247

climate model (Rind et al. (2018)). Variations on these longer timescales are not addressed in this
 study.

<sup>250</sup> We begin by presenting differences in climatological means between the SSP 2-4.5 R and C <sup>251</sup> ensembles and between the  $2xCO_2$  and  $3xCO_2$  integrations. Statistical significance of the SSP <sup>252</sup> 2-4.5 C-R differences is assessed using a Welch's t-test, given the unequal sample sizes represented <sup>253</sup> by the 8-member R and two-member C ensembles. A two-sample Student's t-test is used when <sup>254</sup> comparing the abrupt CO<sub>2</sub> responses. In addition, when putting the SSP 2-4.5 results in the context <sup>255</sup> of the broader 1-to-5xCO<sub>2</sub> forcing range we define all responses relative to a 150-year average over <sup>256</sup> the preindustrial control simulation from which the abrupt CO<sub>2</sub> experiments are "branched".

For the majority of the analysis considered here we focus on December-January-February (DJF) 257 and over the NH. Our focus on DJF is consistent with the presentation in AR2022, while our focus 258 on the NH is motivated by Mitevski et al. (2021), who showed that the AMOC collapse occurring 259 between 2- and  $3xCO_2$  results in a non-monotonic response in global mean surface temperature, 260 driven primarily by changes occurring in the NH (more precisely, the North Atlantic). We deviate 261 from this convention, however, at two different points in this study. First we use annual mean 262 GMST when evaluating the dynamical sensitivity scaling in Section 3b; second, we present the 263 energy budget analysis in Section 3c using annual means in order to facilitate comparison with 264 previous studies. Some results about the Southern Hemisphere (SH) circulation response are also 265 presented, but only discussed briefly. 266

Finally, while our main focus is on the "equilibrated" responses defined above, we are also interested in exploiting the evolution of the responses, as in Grise and Polvani (2017) and Chemke and Polvani (2019). As shown in those studies, consideration of the response timescales of different variables affords unique insight into possible mechanisms governing their evolution.

#### 271 c. Scaling with Global Mean Surface Temperature (GMST)

<sup>272</sup> We begin by comparing the absolute differences in the atmospheric "equilibrated" responses <sup>273</sup> between the SSP 2-4.5 R and C members (Section 3a1-2) and between the 2-and  $3xCO_2$  simulations <sup>274</sup> (Section 3a3). When interpreting these differences, however, it is important to note that these could <sup>275</sup> partly be reflective of background differences in the CO<sub>2</sub> forcing. In particular, the CO<sub>2</sub> values in <sup>276</sup> the SSP 2-4.5 extended experiments peak at 643 ppm, or roughly 2.4 times preindustrial values, and decrease thereafter (see Figure 1a in AR2022). It is perhaps not surprising, therefore, that this value of  $CO_2$  lies in between the 2- and  $3xCO_2$  levels identified in Mitevski et al. (2021) as the transition point between the AMOC recovering and collapsing under abrupt forcing (Figure 1a).

Given these differences in CO<sub>2</sub> forcing (further exaggerated when considering the broader suite 280 of 1-5xCO<sub>2</sub> experiments) it may seem most natural to compare the simulations with respect to 281 their associated instantaneous radiative forcing (RF) as in Mitevski et al. (2021). However, another 282 difference between the transient SSP 2-4.5 and abrupt  $1-5xCO_2$  experiments is the evolution of the 283 forcing. As the AMOC is known to be sensitive to the time history of the forcing, this is important 284 to take into consideration, and so we cast our scaling analysis in Section 3b (in which the SSP 2-4.5 285 results are compared against the broader  $1-5xCO_2$  suite) in terms of GMST. This approach is also 286 more in spirit with Ceppi et al. (2018) as it directly addresses the extent to which the dynamical 287 sensitivity captured in the simulations scales with equilibrium climate sensitivity (Q2). 288

Finally, a related but distinct approach is to normalize by annual mean GMST. KB2021 showed 289 that doing so highlights large differences in temperature gradients and the zonal mean meridional 290 circulation between models in which the AMOC weakens substantially (> 7 Sv), compared to 291 models showing a limited AMOC response (< 7 Sv). However, while this approach is well suited 292 to understanding the multi-model response to the same  $(4xCO_2)$  forcing, it does not directly afford 293 insight into how dynamical sensitivity scales with GMST. As we have tried both normalizing and 294 not normalizing in this study and draw generally very similar conclusions (not shown), we focus 295 on the unnormalized results. 296

#### 297 d. Analysis Approach

#### 298 1) HADLEY CELL AND STORM TRACK DIAGNOSTICS

Whereas KB2021 focused on the latitude of the northern midlatitude jet, here we expand their analysis to also include measures of the Hadley Cell (HC) and the storm tracks. Figure 2a highlights how these measures of the HC and midlatitude jet are coupled through eddy momentum fluxes.

To quantify the characteristics of the Hadley Cell we use metrics calculated using the Tropicalwidth Diagnostics (TropD) code (Adam et al. (2018)) based on fields that were zonally and seasonally averaged before calculation of the metrics. The edge of the HC,  $\phi_{UAS}$ , is defined as the zero-crossing latitude of the surface zonal wind (corresponds to UAS in TropD and is calculated



FIG. 2. (a): Schematic of the main zonal mean dynamical metrics considered in this study, illustrated 302 using data from the preindustrial control simulation. The December-January-February (DJF) climatological 303 mean meridional circulation is shown in black contours, with solid and dashed lines denoting clockwise and 304 counterclockwise directions, respectively (contour interval: 3x10<sup>10</sup> kg/s). The DJF zonally averaged zonal winds 305 are shown in the filled colored contours (only positive values shown; contour interval: 2 m/s) and the DJF 306 eddy momentum fluxes are shown in the grey contours (contour interval: 8 m<sup>2</sup>/s<sup>2</sup>). The purple star denotes the 307 Northern Hemisphere (NH) Hadley Cell strength, or the maximum value of the mean meridional streamfunction 308 at 500 hPa equatorward of where it crosses zero, while the edge is denoted by  $\phi_{\text{UAS}}$  (purple square), or the zero-309 crossing latitude of the surface zonal wind. (b): Annual mean meridional distributions of the total atmospheric 310 (T<sub>A</sub>; black dashed line) and combined atmosphere-ocean (T<sub>A+O</sub>; black solid line) northward energy transports 311 for the preindustrial control simulation. The implied ocean heat transport (T<sub>O</sub>; black circled line), calculated by 312 subtracting  $T_A$  from  $T_{A+O}$ , exhibits good agreed with online calculations of the ocean transports ( $T_O^*$ ; red starred 313 line). For more details see Section 2. 314

using the "zerocrossing" method) (Fig. 2a, purple square). This measure of the HC was shown to correlate well with the latitude at which the mean meridional streamfunction at 500 hPa crosses 0 poleward of its tropical extremum (Waugh et al. (2018)). The value of that tropical extremum ( $\Psi_{500}$ ) is also examined as a measure of HC strength (Fig. 2a, purple star).

In addition to looking at the Hadley Cell, we also examine its relation to the northern midlatitude jet via the eddy momentum fluxes. This is based on research showing a strong connection between the evolution of the Hadley Cell and the latitude of the maximum eddy momentum fluxes

(Schneider (2006); Chemke and Polvani (2019); Menzel et al. (2019)). The eddy momentum fluxes 326 are calculated as in Chemke and Polvani (2019) as the time mean of [u'v'], where u and v are 327 the zonal and meridional winds, respectively, and primes represent deviations from both the zonal 328 and monthly means. In particular we are interested in the latitude where the eddy momentum 329 flux maximizes (eddy momentum convergence = 0) (Fig. 2a, grey contours). As it is well known 330 that the largest eddy momentum flux convergences are closely collocated with the extratropical 331 storm tracks (e.g., Lau et al. (1978), Lim and Wallace (1991)), we also examine the vertically 332 averaged eddy kinetic energy, calculated using daily output. Connections with static stability and 333 baroclinic eddy generation are also made, where the latter is quantified using ~  $\alpha'\omega'$ , where primes 334 denote zonal deviations and  $\alpha$  and  $\omega$  refer to one over the density and vertical velocity in pressure 335 coordinates, respectively. 336

#### 337 2) Energetic Analysis

To put the results of the dynamical analysis in an energetic context we evaluate the total meridional heat transport of the coupled ocean-atmosphere transport system, further partitioned into its oceanic and atmospheric contributions. Following Magnusdottir and Saravannan (1999) we estimate the total vertically integrated atmospheric heat flux ( $T_A$ ) as:

$$\frac{\partial \cos\phi}{\partial \cos\phi\partial\phi} \overline{[T_A]} \equiv \frac{\partial \cos\phi}{\partial \cos\phi\partial\phi} \int_1^0 \overline{(c_p T + gz + Lq) \nu \rho d\eta}$$

 $= [-F_{\rm T} - F_{\rm S} + \rm SHF + \rm LHF] \qquad (1)$ 

as well as the vertically integrated meridional heat flux in the combined atmosphere-ocean system  $(T_{A+O})$  as:

$$\frac{\partial cos\phi}{acos\phi\partial\phi}\overline{[T_{A+O}]} \equiv \overline{[-F_T]}$$
(2)

where moist static energy density is the sum of dry static energy density  $(c_pT + gz)$  and the latent heat density (Lq),  $\rho$  and v refer to the mass density and horizontal velocity on  $\eta$  surfaces. Zonal averages and time averages are denoted by square brackets and overbars, respectively. The terms on the RHS of both equations refer to energy fluxes out of the top of the atmosphere and at the <sup>348</sup> surface:  $F_T$  (net upward flux of radiation at the top of the atmosphere, calculated as outgoing <sup>349</sup> longwave radiation (OLR) minus the absorbed solar radiation (ASR)),  $F_S$  (net downward flux of <sup>350</sup> radiation at the surface equal to the sum of net downward longwave (LWF) and shortwave (SWF) <sup>351</sup> radiation), and the fluxes of latent and sensible heat at the surface (LHF and SHF).

The resulting annual mean meridional distributions of  $T_A$  and  $T_{A+O}$ , calculated using the E2.1 352 150-year preindustrial control simulation, is consistent with the climatological energy transports 353 presented in other studies (e.g., Magnusdottir and Saravannan (1999), Held and Soden (2006)) 354 (Figure 2b). Note that the implied ocean heat transport, calculated by subtracting the first from 355 the second equation above (Fig. 2b, black circled line) is found to exhibit good agreement with 356 online calculations of the ocean transports (Fig. 2b, red starred line). These northward ocean heat 357 transports, simulated in historical integrations using E2.1, have been shown to agree well with 1992-358 2011 estimates from the ECCO ocean state estimate (see Figure 23 in Kelley et al. (2020)). Finally, 359 in addition to examining the compensation between atmospheric and oceanic poleward transports, 360 we also further partition T<sub>A</sub> into its moist versus dry contributions using online calculations of the 361 vertically integrated dry static energy and latent heat northward transports (Section 3c). 362

#### 363 **3. Results**

We begin by contrasting the regional SSP 2.45 R and SSP 2.45 C responses in sea surface 364 temperatures, sea level pressure, precipitation and zonal winds in Section 3a1 and in the large-365 scale zonal mean circulation (Section 3a2). Then we compare the SSP 2.45 C-R differences to 366 the differences between the  $2xCO_2$  and  $3xCO_2$  simulations (Section 3a3), further placing these 367 results in the context of the broader  $1-5xCO_2$  forcing by examining how changes in various 368 thermodynamical and dynamical quantities scale with changes in global mean surface temperature 369 (Section 3b). To interpret the dynamical scaling results we then examine the compensation that 370 arises between the ocean and atmosphere in response to the shutdown of the AMOC (Section 3c). 371

#### 372 a. Equilibrated Responses

373 1) SSP 2-4.5 Collapsed vs. Recovered: Near-Surface Temperatures, Precipitation and
 Winds

Figure 1 (bottom panels) shows the evolution of annual global mean surface temperature in the 375 SSP 2-4.5 C and R members (Fig. 1c) and the abrupt  $CO_2$  experiments (Fig. 1d). Comparing 376 the collapsed versus recovered SSP 2-4.5 ensemble members reveals global cooling in response to 377 a collapse of the AMOC such that by the time that the AMOC has recovered in SSP 2-4.5 R the 378 annual mean global surface temperature is almost one degree warmer, relative to the SSP 2-4.5 379 C members. In the abrupt  $CO_2$  simulations, the GMST change in the  $3xCO_2$  experiment is only 380  $0.6^{\circ}$ C warmer than the 2xCO<sub>2</sub> simulation, reflective of a clear flattening of the warming trend after 381 years ~60-70. Overall, the changes in GMST are 2.2°C, 2.8°C, 3.0°C, and 2.3°C for the 2xCO<sub>2</sub>, 382 3xCO<sub>2</sub> and SSP 2-4.5 recovered and SSP 2-4.5 collapsed ensembles, respectively. 383

That the cooling associated with a steady decline and eventual collapse of the AMOC acts to mitigate, and partially counteract, other components of the global surface temperature change is reflected in a non-monotonic change in equilibrium climate sensitivity that occurs between 2- and  $3xCO_2$  over the broader range of experiments spanning 1-to- $5xCO_2$  (see Figure 1 in Mitevski et al. (2021)). This counteracting of warming due to a weakening of the AMOC has also been shown to occur in  $21^{st}$  century warming simulations (Drijfhout et al. (2012), Caesar et al. (2018), Marshall et al. (2015)).

While the AMOC influence on the climate can occur via its changes in GMST, a reduction in AMOC strength can also influence sea surface temperature patterns. We examine this next, with a focus on DJF, and examine changes in SSTs and associated meridional and zonal gradients over the Atlantic and Pacific (Figure 3a). Note that a saturated color bar has been used in order to highlight the structure of SST changes outside of the North Atlantic region.

Examining first the North Atlantic we find much more cooling occurring in the SSP 2-4.5 collapsed simulations (Fig. 3a) over the subpolar North Atlantic (SPNA), consistent with the results from previous studies. This cooling that occurs within the SPNA region is also associated with a large increase in meridional SST gradients over the North Atlantic south of 40°N. Zonally, gradients are also enhanced over the Gulf Stream between the western and eastern Atlantic basins. There is also an indication of a slight increase in SST gradients in the tropics.

The cooler SSTs in the recovered simulations are not only confined to the Atlantic, but also 402 span the Pacific (Fig. 3a), resulting in stronger meridional SST gradients, particularly over middle 403 northern latitudes. Preliminary analysis of the evolution of the SST response (Appendix Figure 1) 404 shows that this cooling over the extratropical Pacific takes several centuries to fully realize itself 405 and may be related to a deepening and poleward shift of the Aleutian Low (Fig. 3c), resulting in 406 more advection of colder temperatures over the West Pacific (Wu et al. (2008)), although direct 407 thermodynamic advection of colder North Atlantic air may also be occurring. By comparison, the 408 changes in SSTs and associated gradients in the tropical Pacific are much smaller. Unlike some 409 previous studies (Timmermann et al. (2007), Zhang and Delworth (2005)) we find no evidence of 410 an El Niño like response to an AMOC weakening, although the robustness of this response has 411 recently been put into question (KB2021). 412

In the SH, SSTs warm over the extratropics in the SSP 2-4.5 collapsed integrations, compared to the simulations in which the AMOC recovers. This warming takes several centuries to develop (Appendix Figure 1) and resembles the evolution of the SST pattern documented in previous studies (see Figure 7 in Pedro et al. (2018)). This delayed warming over the SH results in increased SST gradients over the South Atlantic ( $\sim 60^{\circ}$ S) in the SSP 2-4.5 C runs, relative to SSP 2-4.5 R, a feature which is not captured in the 3xCO<sub>2</sub> simulation (discussed more in Section 3a3).

In addition to the changes in SSTs, the response in precipitation in the SSP 2-4.5 collapsed simulations reflects large decreases over the North Atlantic subpolar region, reductions over the Amazon and suggestions of a southward shift of the ITCZ over both the Atlantic and East Pacific basins (Fig. 3b). By comparison, the increased precipitation in the West Pacific is not statistically significant, consistent with previous studies (Vellinga and Wood (2008), KB2021).

Moving next to more dynamical measures, we examine changes in sea level pressure and near-424 surface zonal winds (Fig. 3c,d). The changes in sea level pressure show differences over the North 425 Atlantic indicative of enhanced (anticyclonic) high level pressure over the subpolar latitudes in the 426 runs in which the AMOC collapses (Fig. 3c). In addition to these SLP changes over the Atlantic, 427 there is also a pronounced dipole of increased and reduced sea level pressure values over the North 428 Pacific middle and high latitudes. While this response was not discussed in KB2021, earlier studies 429 have shown that a weakening of the AMOC is associated with a deepening of the Aleutian Low 430 (Wu et al. (2008), Liu et al. (2020)). 431



FIG. 3. The difference in the year DJF 2400-2500 climatological mean (a) sea surface temperatures ( $\delta$ SST), (b) precipitation ( $\delta$ PREC), (c) sea level pressure ( $\delta$ SLP), (d) 850 hPa zonal winds ( $\delta$ U<sub>850</sub>) and (e) 500 hPa zonal winds ( $\delta$ U<sub>500</sub>) between the SSP 2-4.5 collapsed (C) and recovered (R) ensemble members. Climatological mean values from the preindustrial control simulation are denoted in the black contours (contour intervals: (a) 5°C, (b) 2 mm/day, (c) 5 mb, (d) 3 m/s and (e) 3 m/s). Grey stippling denotes regions where the SSP 2-4.5 C-R differences are not statistically significant.

Consistent with the SLP pressure changes over the North Pacific, there is a strong signature in 432 the near surface zonal winds (850 hPa) (Fig. 3d). While over the Pacific the wind changes more 433 reflect a poleward shift of the midlatitude jet, over the North Atlantic the jet accelerates and extends 434 further eastward over Europe. This acceleration over the North Atlantic is more pronounced in the 435 mid-troposphere (Fig. 3e), as was also reported in KB2021 who identified a statistically significant 436 strengthening of the midlatitude jet in models featuring a stronger AMOC decline at 250 hPa, but 437 not at 850 hPa. Finally, in contrast to the NH, there is a uniform weakening of the zonal winds over 438 the SH extratropics. We discuss the vertical coherence of these wind changes in the next section. 439

## SSP 2-4.5 Collapsed - Recovered



FIG. 4. The difference in the year DJF 2400-2500 climatological mean zonal mean (a) temperature ( $\delta$ T), (b) zonal wind ( $\delta$ U), (c) eddy kinetic energy ( $\delta$ EKE) and (d) Eulerian mean stream function ( $\delta$ Ψ) between the SSP 2-4.5 collapsed (C) and recovered (R) ensemble members. Climatological mean values from the preindustrial control simulation are denoted in the black contours (contour intervals: (a) 10°C, (b) 8 m/s, (c) 28 m<sup>2</sup>/s<sup>2</sup> and (d) 3x10<sup>10</sup> kg/s). Note that in (d) solid and dashed lines denoting clockwise and counterclockwise directions, respectively. Grey stippling denotes regions where the SSP 2-4.5 C-R differences are not statistically significant.

#### 452 2) SSP 2-4.5 Collapsed VS. Recovered: Vertical Structure

In addition to its impacts on SSTs, changes in the AMOC impact the vertical structure of meridional temperature gradients in the atmosphere. To interpret the zonal wind changes shown in Figure 3 we therefore next examine the zonal mean changes in temperatures, zonal winds and eddy kinetic energy, as well as their coupling to responses in the tropical mean meridional circulation (Figure 4).

We begin by examining changes in temperature (Fig. 4a), which show much more cooling over the NH high latitude troposphere in the SSP 2-4.5 collapsed runs. A similar reduction in Arctic warming was reported in the "strongly" collapsed model ensemble examined in KB2021 (Figure S5) and in Liu et al. (2020) (Figure 6). In addition to the changes over the northern extratropics,



FIG. 5. (a) The difference in the year DJF 2400-2500 climatological mean vertically integrated eddy kinetic energy between the SSP 2-4.5 C and R ensembles. (b) Same as in (a), except showing the difference between the  $3xCO_2$  and  $2xCO_2$  integrations. Climatological mean values from the preindustrial control simulation are denoted in the black contours (contour interval:  $5x10^{-1}$  MJ).

we also find an indication of weak polar amplification characterized by warming throughout the 466 SH middle and high latitudes poleward of  $40^{\circ}$ S, also seen in the SST differences (Fig. 3a). This 467 warming in the SH is consistent with Liu et al. (2020) (see their Figure 6), but inconsistent with 468 KB2021 who, in addition, identified more warming occurring in the tropical upper troposphere, 469 a feature that is not evident in the SSP 2-4.5 collapsed runs. Normalization of our results by 470 GMST (not shown) produces an anomalous upper tropical tropospheric warming, suggesting that 471 the results reports in KB2021 are reflective not of absolute differences in the temperature response 472 but, rather, of the normalization performed in that study. In addition, in the SH the different 473 temperature response compared to KB2021 also likely reflects their use of shorter (150-year-long) 474 integrations. 475

Moving next to the zonal winds (Fig. 4b) we find that the reduced warming over NH high latitudes is associated with enhanced meridional temperature gradients, which result in a poleward

shift of the zonal mean northern midlatitude jet in the runs in which the AMOC collapses. A 478 similar poleward shift in the NH jet was documented in KB2021 (see their Figure 4) and in Liu 479 et al. (2020). In the SH the zonal winds weaken and, if anything shift equatorward, in the SSP 2-4.5 480 C ensemble members, consistent with the weak polar amplification in that region (Fig. 4a). Again, 481 this wind response is highly consistent with Liu et al. (2020), but opposite to that shown in KB2021, 482 who identified a poleward shift of the SH jet, consistent with the different meridional temperature 483 gradient response identified in that study. As that study did not propose a testable mechanism for 484 the SH jet changes, it is not entirely clear what is the driver of the differences between their results 485 and those presented here and in Liu et al. (2020), although both the normalization by GMST as 486 well as the differing integration lengths likely contribute. 487

In concert with the changes in the zonal winds, the changes in eddy kinetic energy (EKE) over 488 the NH feature increases north of 40°N (Fig. 4c). Note that there is no statistically significant 489 response in the subtropics and only the wind (and EKE) changes poleward of 40°N are robust. 490 Zonally, the increases in EKE are concentrated over the North Atlantic and extend eastward over 491 Europe, and well as over the West Pacific (Fig. 5a), strongly resembling the zonal wind changes 492 at 500 hPa (Fig. 3e). Comparisons with the changes in EKE associated with an AMOC collapse 493 in another model (the Community Earth System Model (CESM-LE)) examined in Mitevski et al. 494 (2021) show very similar anomalies (not shown). Furthermore, a spectral decomposition of these 495 NH EKE changes show increased wave energy over wavenumbers 1-6 (primarily in the zonal mean 496 kinetic and available potential energy terms) in the collapsed SSP 2-4.5 members, relative to the 497 recovered members (also not shown). 498

Finally, the changes in the mean meridional stream function indicate an overall strengthening 501 of the wintertime NH Hadley circulation in the collaped SSP 2-4.5 simulations (Fig. 4d). This 502 intensification of the NH Hadley circulation in response to an AMOC shutdown has been reported 503 in previous studies (Zhang and Delworth (2005), Orihuela-Pinto et al. (2022)) and generally 504 associated with a southward displacement of the ITCZ, although Brayshaw et al. (2009) also 505 identify a zonally localized enhancement of the Hadley Cell region over the subtropical Atlantic, 506 which they associate with increased meridional SST gradients in that region. Compared to those 507 studies, however, our results also show a poleward displacement of the northern Hadley Cell edge 508 in the lower troposphere (>500 hPa), a result which has not been directly commented on in the 509

$$3xCO_2 - 2xCO_2$$



FIG. 6. Same as Figure 3, except showing the difference between the year 120-150 climatological mean  $3xCO_2$ and  $2xCO_2$  responses.

literature. These stream function anomalies over the NH extratropical lower troposphere appear to
 be coupled to a slight strengthening and poleward displacement of the northern Ferrel cell.

#### 512 3) Comparison with $2xCO_2$ vs $3xCO_2$

Comparisons of the surface and lower tropospheric impacts associated with an AMOC collapse 513 in the SSP 2-4.5 ensemble (Fig. 3) with those moving from 2- to 3xCO<sub>2</sub> (Fig. 6) reveal a high 514 degree of consistency. In particular, over the North Atlantic the changes moving from  $2xCO_2$  to 515 3xCO<sub>2</sub> reflect much stronger cooling of SSTs (Fig. 6a), reduced precipitation (Fig. 6b) and an 516 anomalous anticylonic circulation over the North Atlantic subpolar gyre region (Fig. 6c), as well 517 as a strengthening and eastward extension of the North Atlantic jet over Europe (Fig. 6d, 6e). The 518 magnitude of these changes is similar in both ensembles, with, if anything, a larger temperature 519 and Atlantic jet response in the AMOC collapsed SSP 2-4.5 ensemble members (Fig. 3). 520

Though the overall responses in the surface temperatures and winds are very similar, there are some important differences worth noting. First, the SSTs in the  $3xCO_2$  simulation show much less cooling over the Pacific northern midlatitudes (> 40°N) compared to the SSP 2-4.5 C simulations, which likely reflects differences in the length of these integrations as this cooling takes centuries to equilibrate (Appendix Figure 1). Second, in response to  $3xCO_2$  there is much more warming over the NH subtropics and tropics, a feature which reflects the higher  $CO_2$  forcing in that simulation. Thus, in contrast to what occurs in the SSP 2-4.5 C ensemble members, there is no suggestion of

<sup>528</sup> SH polar amplification occurring at 3xCO<sub>2</sub>.

The differences in SST gradients over the northern high latitude Pacific and tropics and SH occurring in response to  $3xCO_2$  have implications for the jet and precipitation responses in these regions. In particular, over the Pacific northern midlatitudes, where there is much less cooling than what occurs in the SSP 2-4.5 C integrations, the jet response resembles more of a poleward shift, characterized not only by an acceleration north of 40°N, but also reduced winds ~ 20°N; in the tropical Pacific there is also a much stronger increase in precipitation, relative to the AMOC SSP 2-4.5 C ensemble.

Even over the North Atlantic the SST cooling is slightly weaker and less expansive and the jet 536 response at 850 hPa is not statistically significant at  $3xCO_2$ , relative to the SSP 2-4.5 collapsed 537 ensemble members. In the SH, there is a weak, albeit not statistically significant, suggestion 538 of a poleward shift of the midlatitude jet at 3xCO<sub>2</sub>, which is not evident in the SSP 2-4.5 C 539 integrations. As indicated earlier, all of these differences likely reflect differences in the timescales 540 of the integrations. Nonetheless, despite these subtle differences, the overall similarities between 541 Figures 3 and 6 suggest that the climate response captured moving from  $2xCO_2$  to  $3xCO_2$  is, to 542 first order, determined by the changes in AMOC strength occuring in these simulations. 543

A high degree of consistency is also featured in the vertical response of the large-scale circulation between the AMOC SSP 2-4.5 collapsed ensemble (Fig. 4) and the 3xCO<sub>2</sub> integration (Fig. 7). That is, in concert with stronger cooling over the Arctic (Fig. 7a), the 3xCO<sub>2</sub> simulation features a stronger poleward shift of the NH zonal mean jet (Fig. 7b), increased EKE northward of 40°N (Fig. 7c) and a strengthened Hadley Cell (Fig. 7d).

As near the surface, there are also important differences worth noting in vertical structure. Most noticeably, the amplitude of cooling over the Arctic is much weaker in the  $3xCO_2$  simulation (Fig. 7a) relative to the collapsed SSP 2-4.5 ensemble (Fig. 4a), reflecting the higher CO<sub>2</sub> forcing moving from  $2xCO_2$  to  $3xCO_2$ . This is also reflected in the stronger warming occurring within the tropics and southern latitudes. Nonetheless, these differences in absolute temperature occurring



FIG. 7. Same as Figure 4, except showing the difference between the year 120-150 climatological mean  $3xCO_2$ and  $2xCO_2$  responses.

over the tropics and polar region conspire to produce a similar increase in meridional temperature gradients, compared to the changes in gradients featured in the comparison between the SSP 2-4.5 R and C ensembles. As such, the zonal mean NH jet response is quite similar in the  $3xCO_2$ simulation (Fig. 7b) compared to SSP 2-4.5 C (Fig. 4b) and is also coupled to a increase of EKE on the poleward flank of the jet (Fig. 7c). Maps of the EKE response show that at  $3xCO_2$ much of this increased EKE reflects changes over the Atlantic (Fig. 5b), as in the SSP 2-4.5 C ensemble (Fig. 5a), although there is also increased EKE over the western Pacific and North America.

To summarize: In response to a collapse of the AMOC, our results show widespread cooling over the Arctic and stronger meridional temperature gradients over the NH. This increase in temperature gradients is associated with a poleward shift of the midlatitude jet (and associated eddy energy) as well as a strengthening of the NH Hadley Cell. In the lower troposphere (> 600 hPa) the NH Hadley cell is displaced poleward.

<sup>569</sup> Over the Northern Hemisphere the response to an increase from  $2xCO_2$  to  $3xCO_2$  is remarkably <sup>570</sup> similar to the differences between the SSP 2-4.5 R and C simulations, both in terms of the magnitude and spatial pattern of these changes. Some exceptions, however, include the near surface (850 hPa) wind response over the North Atlantic, which is not statistically significant at  $3xCO_2$ , as well as in the tropics, where precipitation increases strongly over the Pacific. There is also more warming in the tropical upper troposphere and SH in the  $3xCO_2$  simulation. Overall, this close correspondence suggests that the collapse of the AMOC is the dominant driver of the large-scale circulation changes moving from  $2xCO_2$  to  $3xCO_2$  in our model.

# b. Scaling of Equilibrated Thermodynamic and Dynamic Responses with Global Mean Surface Temperature (GMST)

One question that is not addressed in the previous section is how changes in the climate response to an AMOC collapse scale with changes in GMST. To this end, here we expand our analysis to include the results of additional (4- and  $5xCO_2$ ) FOM abrupt CO<sub>2</sub> runs, as well as the results from the SOM abrupt CO<sub>2</sub> integrations.

#### 583 1) GLOBAL THERMODYNAMIC CHANGES

Figure 8a shows the annual global mean surface temperature response among all of the sim-584 ulations, plotted as a function of associated instantaneous radiative forcing (RF), where RF is 585 calculated from the expression  $5.35\ln(NxCO_2/1xCO_2)$  (Byrne and Goldblatt (2014)) and, for each 586 run, N is the CO<sub>2</sub> multiple of the PI value (2.4, for the case of the SSP 2-4.5 ensemble members). 587 The changes in GMST across this broader range of  $CO_2$  forcing show the nonlinear behavior 588 between the 2- and 3xCO<sub>2</sub> FOM simulations (blue circles) that was first identified in Mitevski et al. 589 (2021) (see their Figure 1). By comparison, the results from the SOM experiments (aqua circles) 590 show no evidence of a nonlinearity. This result was also documented in Mitevski et al. (2021) and 591 suggests that the changes in ocean horizontal and vertical heat fluxes not included in the q-flux 592 experiments are primarily responsible for the nonlinear changes in GMST occurring in the FOM 593 experiments. 594

<sup>607</sup> Building on Mitevski et al. (2021), here we also include the results from the SSP 2-4.5 R and C <sup>608</sup> ensemble members (red circles, cyan and blue outlines) which are seen to align respectively with <sup>609</sup> the SOM (solid cyan) and FOM (solid blue) scalings. This suggests that the ocean heat convergence <sup>610</sup> changes that occur in the collapsed SSP 2-4.5 C members are primarily responsible for the GMST



FIG. 8. Top: Changes in annual mean global mean surface temperature (GMST), plotted as a function of the 595 associated radiative forcing (RF), calculated from the expression 5.35ln (NxCO<sub>2</sub>/1xCO<sub>2</sub>) (Byrne and Goldblatt 596 (2014)) where, for each run, N is the CO<sub>2</sub> multiple of the PI value (2.4, for the case of the SSP 2.45 ensemble 597 members), consistent with the presentation in Mitevski et al. (2021). Bottom: Changes in DJF global mean 598 precipitation (left) and atmospheric column water vapor (right). Changes in precipitation and column water 599 vapor are plotted relative to the annual mean GMST changes in (a). Results from the abrupt 2-5xCO<sub>2</sub> fully 600 coupled atmosphere-ocean model (FOM) and slab ocean model (SOM) results are shown in the blue and cyan 601 filled circles. The FOM SSP 2-4.5 recovered (R) and collapsed (C) results are also shown in the red circles 602 (cyan and blue outlines, respectively). Interannual variability for each metric is indicated by the vertical bars. 603 Note that in all panels the SOM  $2xCO_2$  results have been adjusted to match the FOM  $2xCO_2$  results in order to 604 facilitate comparison of the FOM and SOM scalings with CO<sub>2</sub> and GMST, not on the absolute magnitude of the 605 responses. 606

differences, compared to the recovered SSP 2-4.5 R members. Note that the SSP 2-4.5 results are plotted with respect to the peak  $CO_2$  level achieved (i.e. 643 ppm), which occurs at year 2200 (not at the values occurring during years 2400-2500, which are lower (579-598 ppm)) (Meinshausen et al. (2020)).

<sup>615</sup> Next we examine how changes in first-order thermodynamic variables scale with these (nonlinear) <sup>616</sup> changes in GMST. Like the changes in GMST, the changes in global mean precipitation and <sup>617</sup> integrated column water vapor (CWV) also show evidence of a nonlinear behavior, with respect to <sup>618</sup> radiative forcing, occurring in the FOM simulations moving from 2- to 3xCO<sub>2</sub> (Appendix Figure <sup>619</sup> 2). As expected from the GMST changes, this behavior is absent in the SOM integrations and the <sup>620</sup> SSP 2-4.5 C and R members again align with the FOM and SOM scalings, respectively.

However, plotting the precipitation and CWV DJF changes relative to annual mean GMST, reveals that the nonlinear scaling with RF more-or-less disappears (Fig. 8b). This demonstrates that, while the first order global scale hydrological cycle is sensitive to the collapse of the AMOC, this sensitivity occurs primarily through changes in GMST. It is also interesting to note that the lower precipitation values occurring in the SOM integrations, for a given values of GMST, is consistent with the direct effect of greenhouse gases, which tend to suppress global mean precipitation (Samset et al. (2016)).

<sup>628</sup> Finally, we note that the scaling of precipitation and CWV with GMST roughly follow the <sup>629</sup> predictions from Held and Soden (2006), who identified a Clausius-Clapeyron (CC) scaling of <sup>630</sup> integrated column water vapor (dashed black line denoting 7.5%/K, Fig. 8b, left) and a significantly <sup>631</sup> sub-CC scaling of global mean precipitation (1.5%/K, Fig. 8b, right). While some additional <sup>632</sup> nonlinearity in precipitation is also evident at higher CO<sub>2</sub> levels, as this is not immediately relevant <sup>633</sup> to the SSP 2-4.5 ensemble, we reserve further discussion for future work.

#### <sup>634</sup> 2) Northern Hemisphere Dynamical Changes: A Regime Shift

Moving next to the dynamical response, we find that several measures of the NH DJF zonal mean 635 dynamical circulation behave nonlinearly (and even non-monotonically) with respect to radiative 636 forcing in the FOM simulations (Appendix Figure 3). Unlike precipitation and CWV, however, this 637 non-linear behavior in the NH surface wind-based Hadley cell edge (Fig. 8a), Hadley Cell strength 638 (Fig. 8b), northern midlatitude EKE (Fig. 8c), latitude of maximum eddy momentum fluxes (Fig. 639 8d) and northern midlatitude static stability (Fig. 8e) also occurs after plotting as a function of 640 GMST. Overall, these results suggest that there is no clear (certainly not linear) relationship between 641 the northern Hadley Cell (strength and lower tropospheric edge) and midlatitude jet behavior with 642 GMST in simulations (3xCO<sub>2</sub> and SSP 2-4.5 C) in which the AMOC collapses. 643



FIG. 9. Changes in various DJF Northern Hemisphere (NH) dynamical metrics, plotted as a function of GMST. 644 Specifically, shown are the Hadley Cell edge ( $\phi$ ) (a), Hadley Cell strength ( $\Psi_{500}$ ) (b), NH column eddy kinetic 645 energy (EKE) (c), latitude of the maximum NH eddy momentum fluxes (d) and NH midlatitude dry static stability 646 (e). The quantities in (a), (b) and (d) are defined in Section 2, while the zonally averaged EKE and static stability 647 changes have both been averaged over 300-1000 hPa and 30°N-60°N. Results from the abrupt 2-5xCO2 fully 648 coupled atmosphere-ocean model (FOM) and slab ocean model (SOM) results are shown in the blue and cyan 649 filled circles. The FOM SSP 2-4.5 recovered (R) and collapsed (C) ensemble members are shown in the red 650 circles (cyan and blue outlines, respectively). Interannual variability for each metric is indicated by the vertical 651 bars. As in Figure 8 the SOM 2xCO<sub>2</sub> results have been adjusted to match the FOM 2xCO<sub>2</sub> results. 652

Rather, the changes in both the NH Hadley Cell edge and strength reflect an abrupt poleward shift and increase, respectively, moving from 2- to  $3xCO_2$  and between the SSP 2-4.5 R and SSP 2-4.5 C ensemble members. This abrupt poleward shift and strengthening saturates at  $3xCO_2$  and even decreases at higher CO<sub>2</sub> values for certain metrics, despite continued increases in GMST (Fig. 9b, 9c). As such, this saturation in the NH circulation is indicative of a "regime" shift in our model, consistent with the use of the term in Caballero and Langen (2005), albeit for the low-gradient, high temperature regime identified in their study using a more idealized model (see discussion in Section 4). In particular, our results suggest that the AMOC collapse is associated with a regime shift in our model between a climate state in which the Hadley Cell is substantially weaker and displaced equatorward (strong AMOC) and a state in which the Hadley Cell and midlatitude EKE is stronger and displaced poleward (weak AMOC).

Note that, while the increases in Hadley Cell strength (Fig. 9b) have been well documented, the 664 poleward shift in the northern Hadley Cell edge has been less examined (Fig. 9a). Our examination 665 of the Hadley Cell edge, as gauged using the surface zonal winds, is partly motivated by the 666 results presented in Figure 3b, which show increased SLP over the North Pacific and Atlantic high 667 latitudes. That is, the SLP increases over the North Atlantic extend as far south as 40°N and 668 thus, together with the Pacific response, reflect a pattern which is consistent with the SLP pressure 669 signature of an expanded northern edge of the Hadley cell (Schmidt and Grise (2017)). Another 670 motivation comes from KB2021, who suggest that, in addition to reduced warming over the Arctic, 671 stronger tropical heating and a related expansion of the HC may contribute to the poleward shift of 672 the northern jet, although this was never explicitly shown. 673

The fact that changes in the Hadley Cell and midlatitude eddy-driven jet are linked is consistent 674 with recent studies showing that the HC edge is strongly linked to the latitude of maximum eddy 675 momentum fluxes, such that a poleward shift of the jet is associated with HC expansion (Chemke 676 and Polvani (2019), Waugh et al. (2018), Menzel et al. (2019)). As discussed in those studies, 677 this connection is likely associated with changes in the latitude of the maximum eddy momentum 678 fluxes and the vertical potential temperature gradient (i.e., the static stability,  $S_p = -(\frac{T}{\Theta})(\frac{\partial \Theta}{\partial P})$ ) over 679 northern midlatitudes, which also exhibit regime shifts in the NH (Fig. 9 d-e). The sensitivity of the 680 extratropical tropospheric eddy response to even modest changes in isentropic slope, resulting both 681 from changes in baroclinicity and static stability, is well known (Thompson and Birner (2012)) and 682 previous studies have shown that increases in static stability can increase subtropical baroclinicity, 683 causing the HC edge and subtropical eddy fields to shift poleward (Chemke and Polvani (2019); 684 Menzel et al. (2019)). Note that the changes in EKE and static stability are shown averaged over 685 300-1000 hPa and over 30°N-60°N; similar results are found averaging over the entire hemisphere 686 poleward of 20°N. 687

Another interesting feature highlighted in Figure 9 is that for some variables even the *sign* of the response is different than would otherwise be predicted from the SOM experiments which ignore AMOC-associated changes in ocean heat convergence. This applies both to the changes in Hadley Cell strength (Fig. 9b) and tropospheric column averaged EKE (Fig. 9c) which otherwise decrease in response to increasing  $CO_2$ . This role of the ocean in the behavior of projected changes in northern EKE is consistent with Chemke et al. (2022), who showed that changes in ocean heat convergence are essential for correctly capturing the sign of the projected response in future storm track changes over the North Atlantic.

To further relate the changes in the Hadley Cell to the changes in midlatitude eddies, Figure 10 696 shows the evolution of the response in northern HC strength, EKE, baroclinic eddy generation, 697 and midlatitude static stability. Consistent with increases in dry static stability in the 3xCO<sub>2</sub> and 698 SSP 2-4.5 simulations, there is an increase in the generation of northern midlatitude tropospheric 699 baroclinic eddies and eddy kinetic energy and an intensification of the northern HC. The similar 700 behavior among all variables suggests that they are mechanistically related. Furthermore, while 701 changes in tropopause height have also been invoked to interpret future changes in the midlatitude 702 jet stream (Cronin and Jansen (2016), Held (1993), Vallis et al. (2015)) and edge of the Hadley 703 Cell (Lu et al. (2007)), we do not observe a consistent response in tropopause height between the 704 3xCO<sub>2</sub> and SSP 2-4.5 C integrations (not shown), suggesting that tropopause height changes alone 705 are not the primary drivers of the Hadley Cell and jet behaviors exhibited in these runs. 706

<sup>707</sup> Note that the close relationship between the changes in HC strength and midlatitude eddies <sup>708</sup> suggested in Figure 10 initially appears at odds with the findings in Menzel et al. (2019), who <sup>709</sup> showed a strong disconnect between the strength of the subtropical jet and the edge of the Hadley <sup>710</sup> Cell. However, that study inferred this disconnect based on interannual variability and the response <sup>711</sup> to an abrupt  $4xCO_2$  forcing, which both yield a weakening and poleward shift of the Hadley Cell. <sup>712</sup> By comparison, in connection with a southward shifted ITCZ a collapse of the AMOC is associated <sup>713</sup> with a strengthened Hadley Cell (Zhang and Delworth (2005); Orihuela-Pinto et al. (2022)).

#### c. Energetic Analysis: Bjerknes Compensation in Response to an AMOC Shutdown

The previous section showed that, unlike the global mean thermodynamic response, several measures of NH dynamical sensitivity do not scale linearly with changes in global mean surface temperature. Rather, a collapsed AMOC in our model is accompanied by an abrupt strengthening and northward shift of the Hadley Cell and northern midlatitude jet. To better understand why these



FIG. 10. Evolution of DJF Northern Hemisphere Hadley Cell strength (a), eddy kinetic energy (b), baroclinic eddy kinetic energy generation (c) and midlatitude dry static stability (d). The baroclinic eddy generation has been averaged over the same region (300-1000 hPa,  $30^{\circ}N-60^{\circ}N$ ) as the EKE and static stability fields, consistent with Figure 9. Comparisons among the SSP 2-4.5 recovered (R) and collapsed (C) ensemble members (top panels) and between the 2- and  $3xCO_2$  runs (bottom panels) are shown in the green and red lines, respectively. A 5-year moving average has been applied to all time series.

variables exhibit this regime shift we examine the changes in energetics – and their partitioning between the atmosphere and ocean – that arise moving from 2- to  $3xCO_2$  and between the SSP 2-4.5 R and SSP 2-4.5 C members.

#### 1) Ocean and Atmosphere Compensation

Figure 11 shows the response in the annual mean northward total (atmosphere + ocean), oceanic and atmospheric transports, relative to the preindustrial control simulation. Between  $2xCO_2$  and  $3xCO_2$  and between the SSP 2-4.5 R and SSP 2-4.5 C members there is a large decrease/increase in  $T_0/T_A$  over northern latitudes with a peak located at ~30-40°N. This behavior is reflective of an abrupt Bjerknes compensation that emerges in the model, wherein large anomalies in heat transported by the atmosphere increase to approximately balance large reductions in northward ocean transport (Bjerknes (1964)). More precisely, the reduction in northward ocean heat transport

#### Annual Mean Response in Poleward Heat Transport



FIG. 11. Changes in the annual mean atmospheric ( $T_A$ ), oceanic ( $T_O$ ) and total (atmospheric + oceanic,  $T_{A+O}$ ) northward energy transport, relative to the preindustrial control simulation. Results from the SSP 2-4.5 ensemble members and the 2-5xCO<sub>2</sub> simulations are shown in the left and right panels. The simulations in which the AMOC collapses (3xCO<sub>2</sub>, SSP 2-4.5 C) versus recovers (2xCO<sub>2</sub>, SSP 2-4.5 R) are highlighted in the red and green lines, respectively.

<sup>736</sup> in the SSP 2-4.5 C ensemble members and at  $3xCO_2$  is approximately 1 PW (Fig. 11), representing <sup>737</sup> a ~ 50% decrease relative to preindustrial values (Fig. 2b). Magnusdottir and Saravannan <sup>738</sup> (1999) attributed this compensatory response in the atmosphere to high dynamical efficiency of <sup>739</sup> atmospheric eddy transport. Note that the annual mean is shown here to facilitate comparison with <sup>740</sup> the annual mean results presented in previous studies (e.g., see Figure 1 in Zhang and Delworth <sup>741</sup> (2005) and Figure 5 in Zhang et al. (2010)). We note in passing that the responses in the boreal <sup>742</sup> winter transports look very similar (not shown).

<sup>748</sup> What Figure 11 makes clear is that the changes in ocean heat transport are dominated by the <sup>749</sup> changes in the AMOC, as reflected in the magnitude of the compensation occurring at  $3xCO_2$ <sup>750</sup> (similar to the compensation occurring in the SSP 2-4.5 C ensemble) which saturates, despite <sup>751</sup> further increases in CO<sub>2</sub> (and GMST). This helps to explain the behavior of the dynamical indices <sup>752</sup> discussed in the previous section (Fig. 9), which also saturate at  $3xCO_2$  and do not increase <sup>753</sup> (rather, decrease) moving to higher CO<sub>2</sub> forcings. A dramatic reduction in poleward ocean heat transport at ~30-40°N was also noted in the CMIP5 historical models in association with strong air-sea interactions within the midlatitude storm tracks (Outten et al. (2018)) and in several future climate integrations performed using the CMIP5 version of the GISS climate model (E2) Rind et al. (2018). In the latter case, however, the near cessation of the AMOC severely limited, but did not entirely shut off, poleward heat transport, which was partly maintained through the ocean subtropical gyre contribution. Our results also show stronger compensation occurring over SH high latitudes poleward of 40°S.

While the changes in T<sub>O</sub> and T<sub>A</sub> reflect near entire compensation, this compensation is nonethe-761 less not perfect and slightly negative, resulting in a net reduction in the total northward combined 762 atmospheric and oceanic energy transport. This reduction in net poleward energy transport was 763 also found in Liu et al. (2020), who showed that a weakened AMOC caused a larger energy change 764 at the Earth's surface than at the TOA (their Figure S.5). In particular, over the NAWH region 765 they found that more energy was taken from the atmosphere through surface turbulent heat fluxes, 766 resulting in a situation where the NH atmosphere loses more energy at the surface compared to the 767 energy that is gained at the TOA (through reduced OLR). In the GISS model we also find that there 768 is more energy loss at the surface compared to changes at the TOA and that these are primarily 769 associated with reduced latent heat fluxes (Appendix Figure 4). The reductions in surface latent 770 heat fluxes occur over the North Atlantic and are strongly shaped by changes in evaporation (not 771 shown). The exact extent and nature of this compensation, however, is likely shaped strongly by 772 cloud feedbacks (Zhang et al. (2010)) as discussed more in Section 4b. 773

#### 774 2) MOIST VS. DRY ATMOSPHERIC TRANSPORTS

To better understand the nature of the compensation occurring in the GISS model, Figure 12 775 further decomposes the changes in T<sub>A</sub> into changes in the northward transports of latent heat (Fig. 776 12a) and dry static energy (Fig. 12b). Over the SH the changes in dry and moist static energy 777 nearly compensate in all simulations, resulting in weakly negative northward atmospheric transports 778 poleward of ~40°S in both the XxCO<sub>2</sub> and SSP 2-4.5 runs. Equatorward of ~40°S, however, this 779 behavior transitions in the SSP 2-4.5 C members to net positive northward atmospheric transport 780 from the SH subtropics towards and across the equator (which compensates the reduction in 781 oceanic equatorward heat transport in that region evident in Figure 11). This behavior over the SH 782



Annual Mean Response in Latent Heat, Dry and Moist Static Energy Transport

FIG. 12. Changes in the annual mean atmospheric latent heat (a), dry static energy (b) and total moist static energy (c) northward transports, relative to the preindustrial control simulation. Results from the SSP 2-4.5 ensemble members and the 2-5xCO<sub>2</sub> simulations are shown in the top and bottom panels. The simulations in which the AMOC collapses ( $3xCO_2$ , SSP 2-4.5 C) versus recovers ( $2xCO_2$ , SSP 2-4.5 R) are highlighted in the red and green lines, respectively.

<sup>783</sup> subtropics is distinct from what occurs in the XxCO<sub>2</sub> simulations, in which there is overall reduced <sup>784</sup> northward atmospheric transport (and less compensation by the oceanic transports). The fact that <sup>785</sup> the oceanic compensation in this region is weaker at  $3xCO_2$  (relative to the SSP 2-4.5 C members) <sup>786</sup> may reflect the differences in simulation length between the abrupt CO<sub>2</sub> and SSP 2-4.5 integrations <sup>787</sup> or the fact that at  $3xCO_2$  there is increased water vapor in the atmosphere in the warmer climate and <sup>788</sup> hence increased poleward latent heat transport. Notably, however, the AMOC response in all runs <sup>789</sup> has little effect on extratropical latent heat transport over the Southern Hemisphere extratropics.

Aside from the subtle differences between the  $3xCO_2$  and SSP 2-4.5 C runs that occur over the SH subtropics, the fact that the changes in dry static energy (DSE) and latent heat transport nearly compensate over southern and tropical latitudes in all runs is consistent with the expectation from Held and Soden (2006). Interestingly, however, this compensation does not occur over northern latitudes spanning ~10°N to ~40°N, resulting in a net increase in poleward moist static energy

transport (Fig. 12c). Over these latitudes the increased atmospheric energy transport resulting 800 from an AMOC collapse is almost entirely due to changes in dry static energy, not latent heat 801 transport. In particular, DSE transport exhibits a "jump" between 2xCO<sub>2</sub> and 3xCO<sub>2</sub> (also evident 802 in the differences between the SSP 2-4.5 C and SSP 2-4.5 R members) (Fig. 12b); a similar jump is 803 only evident in the latent heat transports equatorward of 20°N (and, if anything, enhances energy 804 transport equatorward, not poleward). The jump in DSE transport over the northern extratropics 805 saturates for forcings greater than  $3xCO_2$ . Further analysis of the evolution of the dry static energy 806 transports at different latitudes in the northern hemisphere (not shown) reveals that these changes 807 in DSE transport first emerge between 30°N-40°N and propagate thereafter to higher latitudes. 808

The fact that the abrupt increase in atmospheric poleward transport derives primarily from 809 changes in DSE transport helps in interpreting why a similar shift emerges in the Hadley Cell and 810 eddy-driven jet, since the Hadley cell fluxes dry static energy poleward (Frierson et al. (2007)). 811 Indeed, previous energetic definitions of the storm track have appealed directly to DSE (e.g. 812 latitude of maximum vertically-integrated dry static energy flux (Hoskins and Valdes (1990)). 813 More recently, Lachmy and Shaw (2018) show that the vertically integrated eddy potential energy 814 flux shifts in same sense as the vertically integrated eddy DSE flux. They then use the Eliassen-815 Palm flux relation to connect these changes in energy fluxes to changes in the eddy momentum 816 fluxes. Therefore, the fact that these features all shift in concert with each other in our runs should 817 perhaps not be too surprising. 818

#### **4. Discussion**

#### 820 a. Caveats Concerning Model Biases

One important caveat with our results relates to known biases in vertical mixing in the ocean 821 component of the GISS model, as discussed in Miller et al. (2021). This biased mixing is 822 likely related to why E2.1 exhibits a more sensitive AMOC response to a quadrupling of  $CO_2$ , 823 compared to some other CMIP6 models (KB2021). In addition, Rind et al. (2020) showed that the 824 parameterization of rainfall evaporation associated with moist convective precipitation has a strong 825 influence on the AMOC sensitivity to greenhouse gas forcing in the E2.1 (and higher top E2.2) 826 models, likely via its effect on moisture loading in the atmosphere. Thus, in addition to oceanic 827 processes, atmospheric parameterizations could also be influencing this result. 828

Along with biases in vertical mixing, the ocean component of E2.1 is also low resolution (one 829 degree). This likely has direct implications for the stability of the AMOC, as discussed in AR2022 830 (see references therein). In particular, the stability of the AMOC will differ between low resolution 831 climate models, which exhibit a negative salt-advection feedback (leading to salinification of the 832 subpolar gyre and AMOC recovery), and eddy-permitting models, which tend to exhibit a stable 833 AMOC-off state. We emphasize here, however, that throughout we have focused on the response of 834 the atmospheric circulation given a collapse in the AMOC. Thus, while the particular mechanisms 835 by which the AMOC is weakened (and subsequently recovers) in E2.1 may be model-specific, 836 our focus has been on quantifying the atmospheric changes. We also note that Mitevski et al. 837 (2021) showed that the behavior of the AMOC in E2.1 was similar to the response in CESM-LE; 838 furthermore that model also featured a nonlinear response in GMST related to a collapse of the 839 AMOC, albeit one occurring at the transition between 3- and  $4xCO_2$ . 840

#### <sup>841</sup> b. Bjerknes Compensation: Cloud Feedbacks and Dry Versus Moist Energy Transports

A key result from our study is that a collapse of the AMOC results in a regime shift in various components of the NH large-scale circulation and this shift is reflective of an abrupt Bjerknes compensation that emerges at  $3xCO_2$  and in the SSP 2-4.5 C ensemble members. There are several aspects of this compensation, however, that require closer examination. Among others, these include:

#### 847 1) INFLUENCE OF CLOUD FEEDBACKS

Mitevski et al. (2022) showed that nonlinearity in ECS occurring between 2- and 3xCO<sub>2</sub> in our 848 model was related to nonlinear variations in the atmospheric feedback parameter and not to changes 849 in radiative forcing. At the same time, the strength of the Bjerknes compensation in our model will 850 likely depend on cloud feedbacks, as the right-hand-side of Equation (1) makes clear (via the  $F_T$  and 851  $F_{S}$  terms). For example, Zhang et al. (2010) showed a strong sensitivity of the tropical climates' 852 response to to changes in cloud feedbacks, showing that in a model with no cloud feedbacks 853 the tropical response to the weakening of the AMOC (including its southward ITCZ shift) was 854 much smaller. Thus, while the overall Bjerknes compensation occurring in our model is generally 855 consistent (in its meridional distribution and amplitude) with the results from other similar studies, 856

the exact details of how compensation occurs is likely to be sensitive to local climate feedbacks which may be model-dependent and/or poorly constrained by observations. Future work will focus on better understanding how changes in cloud feedbacks modulate the response of the atmosphere to a weakened AMOC in our model.

#### 861 2) Atmospheric Dry VS. Moist Compensation

One interesting result from this study is that the large compensation in poleward atmospheric 862 transport that occurs as the AMOC collapses is primarily related to increases in the northward 863 transport of dry static energy northward of 20°N (coincident with the edge of the non-monotonically 864 shifting HC edge) (Fig. 12). This result is initially surprising as it downplays the compensation 865 that occurs through changes in latent heat transport over northern midlatitudes. Thus, while our 866 results do show a compensatory latent heat transport occurring in the tropics, this does not occur 867 over the NH extratropics and is therefore not fundamentally associated with the non-monotonic 868 behavior in the NH Hadley Cell edge and midlatitude eddy-driven jet. 869

The diminished importance of the latent heat transports over northern midlatitudes is initially 870 surprising, given that warming in response to increased  $CO_2$  results in an overall increase in 871 atmospheric water vapor. Upon further reflection, however, this effect of enhanced global warming 872 needs to be considered in the context of both the reduced Arctic warming and poleward shifted 873 EKE evident in Figure 4. The former can, via cooling, reduce the total moisture available for 874 northward transport, while the latter would impact the efficiency with which subtropical moisture 875 is transported poleward to higher latitudes. In our results it appears that these changes compensate, 876 resulting in no net AMOC imprint on the latent heat transports over northern extratropical latitudes 877 (Fig. 10a, bottom). While disentangling these contributions is beyond the scope of this study, we 878 do comment on the consistent results shown in Figure S5 of Mitevski et al. (2021), who identified 879 a much stronger non-monotonicity present in the edge of the dry zone (P-E) compared to NH 880 specific humidity. While this suggests that the circulation changes are themselves responsible for 881 the behavior of the latent heat transports (and not vice versa), more work is needed to understand 882 the underlying mechanism present in our model and whether this behavior is also exhibited in other 883 models (or the real atmosphere). 884

#### **5.** Conclusions

Here we have documented the atmospheric response to an AMOC collapse using the CMIP6 886 version of the NASA GISS climate model (E2.1). Using simulations from an identically forced 887 (SSP 2-4.5) ensemble in which the AMOC collapses and recovers in two and eight members, 888 respectively, we have isolated the atmospheric response to a spontaneous collapse of the AMOC 889 in the context of a warming climate, absent any external perturbations that may interfere with 890 the model's internal dynamics. By comparison, previous studies have all needed to employ 891 (negative) freshwater flux perturbations or similar AMOC "locking" methods (Liu et al. (2020), 892 Orihuela-Pinto et al. (2022)). We then placed the atmospheric response in the SSP 2-4.5 893 simulations in the context of a broad set of integrations in which CO<sub>2</sub> is abruptly increased, run 894 both in fully coupled atmosphere-ocean (FOM) and slab-ocean (SOM) configurations, in which 895 changes in ocean heat flux convergences are respectively included and neglected. Our main results 896 are as follows: 897

898

<sup>899</sup> 1. In our model a sustained decline and eventual collapse of the AMOC results in a <sup>900</sup> strengthening of the NH Hadley cell and the northern midlatitude jet as well as an abrupt <sup>901</sup> northward shift of the Hadley Cell edge in the lower troposphere. Quite remarkably, these features <sup>902</sup> dominate the large-scale atmospheric circulation response that occurs in the NH moving from <sup>903</sup>  $2xCO_2$  to  $3xCO_2$ .

904

<sup>905</sup> 2. For certain variables (i.e., HC strength, EKE) an ultimate collapse of the AMOC pro-<sup>906</sup> duces changes that are *opposite* in sign to the response to increased  $CO_2$  forcing that occurs in the <sup>907</sup> absence of ocean circulation changes.

908

<sup>909</sup> 3. The regime shift in the NH large-scale circulation reflects an abrupt Bjerknes compen-<sup>910</sup> sation that emerges in the  $3xCO_2$  and collapsed SSP 2-4.5 C simulations. This compensation is <sup>911</sup> located further south (~40°N) than what is often considered to be the main region of maximum <sup>912</sup> ocean-atmosphere compensation (70°N) (Shaffrey and Sutton (2006)) and reflects a key role for <sup>913</sup> the midlatitude storm tracks in the coupled system's response to a warmer climate.

914

<sup>915</sup> 4. The impact of the AMOC on the large-scale NH circulation occurs mainly through its <sup>916</sup> influence on mean free-tropospheric temperature gradients, not GMST. This finding reinforces <sup>917</sup> growing evidence that the climate's "dynamical sensitivity" does not scale with equilibrium <sup>918</sup> climate sensitivity (Grise and Polvani (2016), Ceppi et al. (2018)), particularly in the presence of <sup>919</sup> a collapsed AMOC.

- 920
- 921

The regime shift in NH dynamics resulting from an AMOC collapse in our model is, to the best 922 of our knowledge, the first time that such behavior has been documented for a CMIP class model. 923 While previous studies have also reported nonlinear behaviors in Hadley Cell strength (Levine and 924 Schneider (2011), O'Reilly et al. (2016)) these studies have employed mainly idealized models. In 925 addition to the changes in the Hadley Cell we also identify a regime shift in the behavior of the 926 northern storm tracks. This result brings to mind the findings from Caballero and Langen (2005), 927 who showed that poleward energy transport increases over a range of increasing surface temperature 928 but saturates in the low-gradient, high temperature regime. As in our study, they attribute this 929 "low-gradient" paradox to increasing tropospheric static stability and the poleward migration of 930 the storm tracks. However, they too employed a highly idealized (aquaplanet) model and find that 931 this saturation in storm track behavior is related to a saturation of latent heat transport. Our results, 932 by comparison, highlight the role of compensatory dry static energy transports and suggests 933 that studies accounting for dynamic ocean-atmospheric coupling (i.e., changes in vertical and 934 horizontal ocean heat fluxes) may come to different conclusions about the nature of compensation 935 in the atmosphere. 936

In addition to contributing to improved understanding of the coupled atmosphere-ocean response to a weakening of the AMOC, our results also have a practical implication for the purpose of developing storylines of atmospheric circulation changes (Zappa and Shepherd (2017)) and for interpreting model differences in projected storm tracks. In particular, while the use of "global warming levels" applied throughout the IPCC AR6 report may suffice for understanding the global hydrological cycle (Hausfather et al. (2022)) here we have shown that this does not hold true for projections of the NH jet stream and Hadley Cell edge. This underscores the need to understand the direct impact of the AMOC on meridional temperature gradients and not only on surface temperature.

Finally, preliminary analysis of the high-top GISS climate model (E2.2 (Rind et al. (2020), Orbe et al. (2020)) suggests a different sensitivity of the AMOC compared to E2.1 (occurring between  $3xCO_2$  and  $4xCO_2$ ). Understanding these differences and how they are reflected in different Bjerknes compensations will be described in a follow-up paper. Acknowledgments. C.O. thanks Ivan Mitevski for processing the zonally varying eddy kinetic energy fields that were used as part of this analysis. Climate modeling at GISS is supported by the NASA Modeling, Analysis and Prediction program, and resources supporting this work were provided by the NASA High-End Computing (HEC) Program through the NASA Center for Climate Simulation (NCCS) at Goddard Space Flight Center.

Data availability statement. The CMIP6 SSP 2 - 4.5data used this in 955 is available from the Grid Federation (ESGF) study Earth System 956 (https://esgf-node.llnl.gov/search/cmip6/) or from the NASA Center for Climate Simu-957 lations (NCCS) (https://portal.nccs.nasa.gov/datashare/giss/cmip6/). The specific simulations 958 used here are a subset of the historical r[1-10]i1p1f2 (doi: 87010.22033/ESGF/CMIP6.7127) 959 and SSP 2-4.5 r[1-10]i1p1f2 (doi: 10.22033/ESGF/CMIP6.7415) runs. The XxCO<sub>2</sub> data 960 used to produce the figures in the study is publicly available in a Zenodo repository at 961 https://doi.org/10.5281/zenodo.3901624. The authors acknowledge the World Climate 962 Research Programme's Working Group on Coupled Modeling and we thank all climate modeling 963 groups for making available their model output. All GISS ModelE components are open source 964 and available at https://www.giss.nasa.gov/tools/modelE/. 965

### APPENDIX

## **Appendix Figures**

967



#### Evolution of DJF Response in Sea Surface Temperature ( $\delta$ SST)

FIG. A1. The evolution of the DJF sea surface temperature difference, relative to the preindustrial control simulation, in one of the SSP 2-4.5 recovered (R) (left) and collapsed (C) ensemble members (middle). The difference between the SSP 2-4.5 recovered and collapsed ensemble members is also shown (right). Note that only one ensemble member is used due to the different recovery times of the AMOC among the "recovered" ensemble members prior to year 2400. Climatological mean values from the preindustrial control simulation are denoted in the black contours.



FIG. A2. Changes in DJF global mean precipitation (a) and atmospheric column water vapor (b), plotted as a function of the associated radiative forcing (RF), calculated from the expression  $5.35\ln(NxCO_2/1xCO_2)$  (Byrne Goldblatt (2014)) where, for each run, N is the CO<sub>2</sub> multiple of the PI value (2.4, for the case of the SSP 2-4.5 ensemble members). Results from the abrupt 2-5xCO<sub>2</sub> fully coupled atmosphere-ocean model (FOM) and slab ocean model (SOM) results are shown in the blue and cyan filled circles. The FOM SSP 2-4.5 recovered and collapsed ensemble members are also shown in the red circles (cyan and blue outlines, respectively). Interannual variability for each metric is indicated by the vertical bars.



FIG. A3. Changes in various DJF Northern Hemisphere (NH) dynamical metrics, plotted as a function of 981 associated radiative forcing. Specifically, shown are the Hadley Cell edge ( $\phi_{\text{UAS}}$ ) (a), Hadley Cell strength ( $\Psi_{500}$ ) 982 (b), NH column eddy kinetic energy (EKE) (c), latitude of the maximum NH eddy momentum fluxes (d) and NH 983 midlatitude dry static stability (e). The quantities in (a), (b) and (d) are defined in Section 2, while the zonally 984 averaged EKE and static stability changes have both been averaged over 300-1000 hPa and 30°N-60°N. Results 985 from the abrupt 2-5xCO<sub>2</sub> fully coupled atmosphere-ocean model (FOM) and slab ocean model (SOM) results 986 are shown in the blue and cyan filled circles. The FOM SSP 2-4.5 recovered and collapsed ensemble members 987 shown in the red circles (cyan and blue outlines, respectively). Interannual variability for each metric is indicated 988 by the vertical bars. 989



FIG. A4. Changes in the annual mean top of the atmosphere outgoing longwave radiation (OLR) (a) and absorbed shortwave radiation (ASR) (b) and the downward fluxes of radiation at the surface, decomposed into longwave (LWF) (c) and shortwave (SWF) (d) components. The fluxes of latent and sensible heat at the surface (LHF and SHF) are shown in (e) and (f), respectively. All changes are shown for the SSP 2-4.5 collapsed (C) (red) and SSP 2-4.5 recovered (R) (green) ensemble members and are defined relative to the preindustrial control simulation.

#### 996 **References**

- Adam, O., and Coauthors, 2018: The TropD software package (v1): standardized methods for calculating tropical-width diagnostics. *Geoscientific Model Development*, **11** (**10**), 4339–4357.
- Bellomo, K., M. Angeloni, S. Corti, and J. von Hardenberg, 2021: Future climate change shaped
   by inter-model differences in Atlantic meridional overturning circulation response. *Nature Communications*, **12** (**1**), 1–10.
- <sup>1002</sup> Bjerknes, J., 1964: Atlantic air-sea interaction. *Advances in geophysics*, Vol. 10, Elsevier, 1–82.
- Brayshaw, D. J., T. Woollings, and M. Vellinga, 2009: Tropical and extratropical responses of the
   north atlantic atmospheric circulation to a sustained weakening of the moc. *Journal of Climate*,
   22 (11), 3146–3155.
- <sup>1006</sup> Byrne, B., and C. Goldblatt, 2014: Radiative forcing at high concentrations of well-mixed green-<sup>1007</sup> house gases. *Geophysical Research Letters*, **41** (**1**), 152–160.
- <sup>1008</sup> Caballero, R., and P. L. Langen, 2005: The dynamic range of poleward energy transport in an <sup>1009</sup> atmospheric general circulation model. *Geophysical Research Letters*, **32** (2).
- Caesar, L., S. Rahmstorf, A. Robinson, G. Feulner, and V. Saba, 2018: Observed fingerprint of a
   weakening Atlantic ocean overturning circulation. *Nature*, 556 (7700), 191–196.
- <sup>1012</sup> Ceppi, P., G. Zappa, T. G. Shepherd, and J. M. Gregory, 2018: Fast and slow components of <sup>1013</sup> the extratropical atmospheric circulation response to CO<sub>2</sub> forcing. *Journal of Climate*, **31** (**3**), <sup>1014</sup> 1091–1105.
- <sup>1015</sup> Chemke, R., and L. M. Polvani, 2019: Exploiting the abrupt  $4 \times CO_2$  scenario to elucidate tropical <sup>1016</sup> expansion mechanisms. *Journal of Climate*, **32** (**3**), 859–875.
- <sup>1017</sup> Chemke, R., L. Zanna, C. Orbe, L. T. Sentman, and L. M. Polvani, 2022: The future intensification
- <sup>1018</sup> of the North Atlantic winter storm track: the key role of dynamic ocean coupling. *Journal of* <sup>1019</sup> *Climate*, **35 (8)**, 2407–2421.
- <sup>1020</sup> Cheng, W., J. C. Chiang, and D. Zhang, 2013: Atlantic meridional overturning circulation (AMOC)
   <sup>1021</sup> in CMIP5 models: RCP and historical simulations. *Journal of Climate*, **26** (**18**), 7187–7197.

- <sup>1022</sup> Cronin, T. W., and M. F. Jansen, 2016: Analytic radiative-advective equilibrium as a model for <sup>1023</sup> high-latitude climate. *Geophysical Research Letters*, **43** (1), 449–457.
- Deser, C., and A. S. Phillips, 2009: Atmospheric circulation trends, 1950–2000: The relative roles
   of sea surface temperature forcing and direct atmospheric radiative forcing. *Journal of Climate*,
   22 (2), 396–413.
- <sup>1027</sup> Drijfhout, S., G. J. Van Oldenborgh, and A. Cimatoribus, 2012: Is a decline of AMOC causing the <sup>1028</sup> warming hole above the North Atlantic in observed and modeled warming patterns? *Journal of* <sup>1029</sup> *Climate*, **25** (**24**), 8373–8379.
- Frierson, D. M., I. M. Held, and P. Zurita-Gotor, 2007: A gray-radiation aquaplanet moist GCM. Part II: Energy transports in altered climates. *Journal of the Atmospheric Sciences*, **64** (**5**), 1680–1693.
- Gervais, M., J. Shaman, and Y. Kushnir, 2019: Impacts of the North Atlantic warming hole in
   future climate projections: Mean atmospheric circulation and the North Atlantic jet. *Journal of Climate*, **32** (10), 2673–2689.
- Grise, K. M., and L. M. Polvani, 2014: The response of midlatitude jets to increased co2: Distinguishing the roles of sea surface temperature and direct radiative forcing. *Geophysical Research Letters*, **41** (**19**), 6863–6871.
- <sup>1039</sup> Grise, K. M., and L. M. Polvani, 2016: Is climate sensitivity related to dynamical sensitivity? *Journal of Geophysical Research: Atmospheres*, **121** (10), 5159–5176.
- Grise, K. M., and L. M. Polvani, 2017: Understanding the time scales of the tropospheric circulation response to abrupt co2 forcing in the southern hemisphere: Seasonality and the role of the stratosphere. *Journal of Climate*, **30** (**21**), 8497–8515.
- Haarsma, R., F. Selten, and S. Drijfhout, 2015: Decelerating Atlantic meridional overturning
   circulation main cause of future west european summer circulation changes. *Environmental Research Letters*, 10 (9).
- Hausfather, Z., K. Marvel, G. A. Schmidt, J. W. Nielsen-Gammon, and M. Zelinka, 2022: Climate
   simulations: Recognize the 'hot model' problem. Nature Publishing Group.

- Held, I. M., 1993: Large-scale dynamics and global warming. *Bulletin of the American Meteoro- logical Society*, **74** (2), 228–242.
- Held, I. M., and B. J. Soden, 2006: Robust responses of the hydrological cycle to global warming.
   *Journal of climate*, **19** (**21**), 5686–5699.
- Hoskins, B. J., and P. J. Valdes, 1990: On the existence of storm-tracks. *Journal of Atmospheric Sciences*, **47** (**15**), 1854–1864.
- Jackson, L., R. Kahana, T. Graham, M. Ringer, T. Woollings, J. Mecking, and R. Wood, 2015:
   Global and european climate impacts of a slowdown of the AMOC in a high resolution GCM.
   *Climate dynamics*, 45 (11), 3299–3316.
- James, R., R. Washington, C.-F. Schleussner, J. Rogelj, and D. Conway, 2017: Characterizing halfa-degree difference: a review of methods for identifying regional climate responses to global warming targets. *Wiley Interdisciplinary Reviews: Climate Change*, **8** (**2**), e457.
- Josey, S. A., J. J.-M. Hirschi, B. Sinha, A. Duchez, J. P. Grist, and R. Marsh, 2018: The recent Atlantic cold anomaly: Causes, consequences, and related phenomena. *Annual Review of Marine Science*, **10**, 475–501.
- Kelley, M., and Coauthors, 2020: GISS-E2. 1: Configurations and climatology. *Journal of Ad- vances in Modeling Earth Systems*, **12 (8)**, e2019MS002025.
- Lachmy, O., and T. Shaw, 2018: Connecting the energy and momentum flux response to climate change using the Eliassen-Palm relation. *Journal of Climate*, **31** (**18**), 7401–7416.
- Lau, N.-C., H. Tennekes, and J. M. Wallace, 1978: Maintenance of the momentum flux by transient eddies in the upper troposphere. *Journal of Atmospheric Sciences*, **35** (1), 139–147.
- Levine, X. J., and T. Schneider, 2011: Response of the Hadley circulation to climate change in
- <sup>1071</sup> an aquaplanet GCM coupled to a simple representation of ocean heat transport. *Journal of the* <sup>1072</sup> *Atmospheric Sciences*, **68** (4), 769–783.
- Lim, G. H., and J. M. Wallace, 1991: Structure and evolution of baroclinic waves as inferred from regression analysis. *Journal of Atmospheric Sciences*, **48** (**15**), 1718–1732.

- <sup>1075</sup> Liu, W., A. V. Fedorov, S.-P. Xie, and S. Hu, 2020: Climate impacts of a weakened Atlantic <sup>1076</sup> Meridional Overturning Circulation in a warming climate. *Science advances*, **6** (**26**), eaaz4876.
- Lu, J., G. A. Vecchi, and T. Reichler, 2007: Expansion of the hadley cell under global warming. *Geophysical Research Letters*, **34** (6).
- <sup>1079</sup> Magnusdottir, G., and R. Saravannan, 1999: The response of atmospheric heat transport to zonally-<sup>1080</sup> averaged SST trends. *Tellus A: Dynamic Meteorology and Oceanography*, **51** (5), 815–832.
- Marshall, J., J. R. Scott, K. C. Armour, J.-M. Campin, M. Kelley, and A. Romanou, 2015: The ocean's role in the transient response of climate to abrupt greenhouse gas forcing. *Climate Dynamics*, **44** (**7**), 2287–2299.
- Meinshausen, M., and Coauthors, 2020: The shared socio-economic pathway (SSP) greenhouse gas concentrations and their extensions to 2500. *Geoscientific Model Development*, **13 (8)**, 3571–3605.
- Menary, M. B., and R. A. Wood, 2018: An anatomy of the projected North Atlantic warming hole
   in CMIP5 models. *Climate Dynamics*, **50** (7), 3063–3080.
- Menzel, M. E., D. Waugh, and K. Grise, 2019: Disconnect between Hadley cell and subtropical jet
   variability and response to increased CO<sub>2</sub>. *Geophysical Research Letters*, 46 (12), 7045–7053.
- <sup>1091</sup> Miller, R. L., and Coauthors, 2021: CMIP6 historical simulations (1850–2014) with GISS-E2. 1. <sup>1092</sup> *Journal of Advances in Modeling Earth Systems*, **13** (**1**), e2019MS002 034.
- <sup>1093</sup> Mitevski, I., C. Orbe, R. Chemke, L. Nazarenko, and L. M. Polvani, 2021: Non-monotonic <sup>1094</sup> response of the climate system to abrupt CO<sub>2</sub> forcing. *Geophysical research letters*, **48** (**6**), <sup>1095</sup> e2020GL090 861.
- <sup>1096</sup> Mitevski, I., L. M. Polvani, and C. Orbe, 2022: Asymmetric warming/cooling response to CO<sub>2</sub>
- <sup>1097</sup> increase/decrease mainly due to non-logarithmic forcing, not feedbacks. *Geophysical Research* <sup>1098</sup> Letters, 49 (5), e2021GL097 133.
- Nazarenko, L. S., and Coauthors, 2022: Future climate change under SSP emission scenarios with
   GISS-E2. 1. *Journal of Advances in Modeling Earth Systems*, e2021MS002871.

- Orbe, C., and Coauthors, 2020: GISS model E2. 2: A climate model optimized for the middle
   atmosphere—2. Validation of large-scale transport and evaluation of climate response. *Journal* of *Geophysical Research: Atmospheres*, **125** (24), e2020JD033 151.
- O'Reilly, C. H., M. Huber, T. Woollings, and L. Zanna, 2016: The signature of low-frequency
   oceanic forcing in the Atlantic Multidecadal Oscillation. *Geophysical Research Letters*, 43 (6),
   2810–2818.
- <sup>1107</sup> Orihuela-Pinto, B., M. H. England, and A. S. Taschetto, 2022: Interbasin and interhemispheric <sup>1108</sup> impacts of a collapsed Atlantic Overturning Circulation. *Nature Climate Change*, 1–8.

Outten, S., I. Esau, and O. H. Otterå, 2018: Bjerknes compensation in the CMIP5 climate models.
 *Journal of Climate*, **31** (**21**), 8745–8760.

- Pedro, J. B., M. Jochum, C. Buizert, F. He, S. Barker, and S. O. Rasmussen, 2018: Beyond
- the bipolar seesaw: Toward a process understanding of interhemispheric coupling. *Quaternary Science Reviews*, **192**, 27–46.
- Rahmstorf, S., J. E. Box, G. Feulner, M. E. Mann, A. Robinson, S. Rutherford, and E. J. Schaffer nicht, 2015: Exceptional twentieth-century slowdown in Atlantic Ocean overturning circulation.
   *Nature climate change*, 5 (5), 475–480.
- Rind, D., G. A. Schmidt, J. Jonas, R. Miller, L. Nazarenko, M. Kelley, and J. Romanski, 2018:
   Multicentury instability of the Atlantic meridional circulation in rapid warming simulations with
   GISS ModelE2. *Journal of Geophysical Research: Atmospheres*, **123** (12), 6331–6355.
- Rind, D., and Coauthors, 2020: GISS Model E2. 2: A climate model optimized for the middle atmosphere—Model structure, climatology, variability, and climate sensitivity. *Journal of Geophysical Research: Atmospheres*, **125** (10), e2019JD032 204.
- Robson, J., P. Ortega, and R. Sutton, 2016: A reversal of climatic trends in the North Atlantic since
   2005. *Nature Geoscience*, 9 (7), 513–517.
- Romanou, A., and Coauthors, Under Review: Stochastic bifurcation of the North Atlantic circulation under a mid-range future climate scenario with the NASA-GISS ModelE. *Journal of Climate*.

- Samset, B., and Coauthors, 2016: Fast and slow precipitation responses to individual climate forcers: A pdrmip multimodel study. *Geophysical research letters*, **43** (**6**), 2782–2791.
- Santer, B. D., T. M. Wigley, M. E. Schlesinger, and J. F. Mitchell, 1990: Developing climate
   scenarios from equilibrium GCM results.
- Schmidt, D. F., and K. M. Grise, 2017: The response of local precipitation and sea level pressure
   to Hadley cell expansion. *Geophysical Research Letters*, 44 (20), 10–573.
- Schneider, T., 2006: The general circulation of the atmosphere. *Annu. Rev. Earth Planet. Sci.*, **34**, 655–688.
- Shaffrey, L., and R. Sutton, 2006: Bjerknes compensation and the decadal variability of the energy
   transports in a coupled climate model. *Journal of Climate*, **19** (**7**), 1167–1181.
- <sup>1138</sup> Shaw, T., and A. Voigt, 2015: Tug of war on summertime circulation between radiative forcing <sup>1139</sup> and sea surface warming. *Nature Geoscience*, **8** (**7**), 560–566.
- <sup>1140</sup> Shepherd, T. G., 2014: Atmospheric circulation as a source of uncertainty in climate change <sup>1141</sup> projections. *Nature Geoscience*, **7** (**10**), 703–708.
- <sup>1142</sup> Smith, D. M., R. Eade, N. J. Dunstone, D. Fereday, J. M. Murphy, H. Pohlmann, and A. A. Scaife,
- 2010: Skilful multi-year predictions of Atlantic hurricane frequency. *Nature geoscience*, **3 (12)**,
  846–849.
- Tebaldi, C., and J. M. Arblaster, 2014: Pattern scaling: Its strengths and limitations, and an update
  on the latest model simulations. *Climatic Change*, **122** (**3**), 459–471.
- Thompson, D. W., and T. Birner, 2012: On the linkages between the tropospheric isentropic slope
   and eddy fluxes of heat during Northern Hemisphere winter. *Journal of the atmospheric sciences*,
   69 (6), 1811–1823.
- Timmermann, A., and Coauthors, 2007: The influence of a weakening of the Atlantic meridional
  overturning circulation on ENSO. *Journal of climate*, **20** (**19**), 4899–4919.
- Vallis, G. K., P. Zurita-Gotor, C. Cairns, and J. Kidston, 2015: Response of the large-scale structure
   of the atmosphere to global warming. *Quarterly Journal of the Royal Meteorological Society*,
   141 (690), 1479–1501.

- <sup>1155</sup> Vellinga, M., and R. A. Wood, 2008: Impacts of thermohaline circulation shutdown in the twenty-<sup>1156</sup> first century. *Climatic Change*, **91** (1), 43–63.
- Vial, J., C. Cassou, F. Codron, S. Bony, and Y. Ruprich-Robert, 2018: Influence of the Atlantic
   meridional overturning circulation on the tropical climate response to CO<sub>2</sub> forcing. *Geophysical Research Letters*, 45 (16), 8519–8528.
- <sup>1160</sup> Waugh, D. W., and Coauthors, 2018: Revisiting the relationship among metrics of tropical expan-<sup>1161</sup> sion. *Journal of Climate*, **31 (18)**, 7565–7581.
- Weijer, W., W. Cheng, O. A. Garuba, A. Hu, and B. Nadiga, 2020: CMIP6 models predict significant 21<sup>st</sup> century decline of the Atlantic meridional overturning circulation. *Geophysical Research Letters*, **47** (**12**), e2019GL086 075.
- Woollings, T., J. M. Gregory, J. G. Pinto, M. Reyers, and D. J. Brayshaw, 2012: Response of the North Atlantic storm track to climate change shaped by ocean–atmosphere coupling. *Nature Geoscience*, **5** (**5**), 313–317.
- <sup>1168</sup> Wu, L., C. Li, C. Yang, and S.-P. Xie, 2008: Global teleconnections in response to a shutdown of the Atlantic meridional overturning circulation. *Journal of Climate*, **21** (**12**), 3002–3019.
- <sup>1170</sup> Zappa, G., and T. G. Shepherd, 2017: Storylines of atmospheric circulation change for european <sup>1171</sup> regional climate impact assessment. *Journal of Climate*, **30** (**16**), 6561–6577.
- <sup>1172</sup> Zhang, R., and T. L. Delworth, 2005: Simulated tropical response to a substantial weakening of <sup>1173</sup> the Atlantic thermohaline circulation. *Journal of climate*, **18** (**12**), 1853–1860.
- <sup>1174</sup> Zhang, R., and T. L. Delworth, 2006: Impact of Atlantic multidecadal oscillations on India/Sahel <sup>1175</sup> rainfall and Atlantic hurricanes. *Geophysical research letters*, **33** (**17**).
- <sup>1176</sup> Zhang, R., S. M. Kang, and I. M. Held, 2010: Sensitivity of climate change induced by the <sup>1177</sup> weakening of the Atlantic meridional overturning circulation to cloud feedback. *Journal of* <sup>1178</sup> *Climate*, **23** (2), 378–389.